

# Rethinking the State as Institution. Central power, local culture and center-periphery relations in Juan Maiguashca's interpretations and the Schwarz-Carvalho Franco's debate

Repensando el Estado como institución. Poder central, cultura local y relaciones centro-periferia en las interpretaciones de Juan Maiguashca y el debate Schwarz-Carvalho Franco.\*

DOI

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1590/2236-463320161308>

**Santiago Cabrera Hanna**

Universidade de São Paulo – USP,  
São Paulo – SP, Brasil

Universidad Andina Simón Bolívar,  
Sede Ecuador, Quito, Ecuador.  
scabrerahanna@gmail.com

\*

Este artículo proviene, inicialmente, de las discusiones sostenidas dentro del curso "A Configuração do Estado Monárquico no Século XIX e O Poder Moderador", ministrado por la Profa. Dra. Cecília Helena de Salles Oliveira en el programa de posgrado en Historia Social de Universidade de São Paulo (USP), y posteriores diálogos sostenidos con colegas historiadores ecuatorianos y brasileños. El objetivo inicial fue el de entablar una conversación historiográfica entre algunos aportes relacionados con la formación del Estado y sus interpretaciones basadas en modelos de análisis de centro-periferia. Agradezco los apuntes y comentarios formulados al texto por Guillermo Bustos y Cecília Helena Salles de Oliveira, así como a los colegas del Área de Historia de la Universidad Andina Simón Bolívar, Sede Ecuador (UASB-E), comunidad de la que formo parte.

## Abstract

This article aims to challenge the models of analysis about the 19th Century State and its implications to the national formation, starting from a bibliographical review on some of the most relevant works about the theme, which is tackled here by taking into consideration the Ecuadorian and Brazilian cases. The reasons for doing so is to closely scrutinize one of the major historiographical interpretations of the process of national formation in Ecuador, which has turned out to be an important framework to Ecuadorian historiography about the subject. We hereby refer to the study of the State as an institution, developed in the 1990s by Juan Maiguashca. The interpretive contributions of this renowned scholar rose at that time, challenging scenarios for a topic that until then had been defined by the view of the state as a structure of domination. This article retrieves critically this contribution by submitting to questioning the conception of central power formation, based on a center-periphery model of analysis present by the Brazilian scholars Roberto Schwarz and Maria Sylvania de Carvalho Franco.

## Resúmen

Este artículo se propone interrogar los modelos de análisis sobre la formación del estado decimonónico y sus implicaciones para la conformación nacional, por medio de un balance bibliográfico de dos de los aportes más destacados en cuanto al tema, desarrollados para los casos ecuatoriano y brasileño. El pretexto de esta conversación es someter a escrutinio una de las interpretaciones historiográficas centrales para el estudio de la formación de la nación en el Ecuador, y que ha devenido en lecho común de la historiografía ecuatoriana sobre el tema. Nos referimos al estudio del Estado como institución, desarrollado en la década de los noventa del siglo XX por Juan Maiguashca. Los aportes interpretativos de este estudioso plantearon, en su momento, desafiantes escenarios para el estudio de un tema que, hasta entonces, fue acometido desde la perspectiva del Estado como estructura de dominación. Este artículo recupera críticamente dicho aporte sometiendo a interpelación su concepción del movimiento de conformación del poder central, basado en un modelo de análisis centro – periferia, presente en la discusión de los intelectuales brasileños

---

## Keywords

Historiography; Ecuador; Mexico; Brazil; 19th Century; Central Power; Local Powers; Municipality; Ideas Out Of Place; Local Culture.

## Palabras Clave

Historiografía; Ecuador; Brasil; Siglo XIX; Poder Central; Poderes Locales; Municipio; Ideas Fuera de Lugar; Cultura Local.

## Introduction

Generally, the historiography of state formation of Ecuador in 19<sup>th</sup> Century has been analyzed from two perspectives: as a structure of domination, and as an institution. According to the first perspective, the period marked between the second half of the 18<sup>th</sup> and the first 50 years of the 19<sup>th</sup> Centuries, corresponds to that of the regional disarticulation and the rise of warlords. The absence of internal links led to the emergence of two dominant sectors: the mountain oligarchy enucleated around Farm system (*Haciendas*), and the coastal oligarchy linked to the centers of world capitalism through the exploitation of cocoa.<sup>1</sup>

According to that interpretation, being the Inter-Andean region the most densely populated space during the first half of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century, were the highland elites who controlled the majority of the population and maintained state control. These aspects are sources of almost all the tensions between the two groups:

[...]Under these conditions, the political existence of the rising Ecuador is characterized by a marked disruption. The phenomenon of "regionalism" is a consequence of the segmentation of power, conspiring not only against the unit, but against the very existence of the country. The traditional autonomy of the Gran-Colombia departments (Quito, Guayaquil and Cuenca), and even levels of decentralization of provinces, municipalities and parishes, clearly manifest this phenomenon.<sup>2</sup> [Translation]

In this approach, the formation of 19<sup>th</sup> Century republican State is the result of tensions between clearly defined dominant sectors, whose participation in the embryonic State structure arises from regional administrative division that is woven from the cyclical forging of political and military alliances in the perspective of ensuring a certain territorial and population control.

Moreover, according to the same interpretation, the period since the crisis of the Spanish monarchy and independence, until 1875, inclusive, characterized by the political predominance of so-called "landlords" *caudillos* proud of their role in independence wars, related by marriage relations with local native elites and very specific domination projects, that were waiting for their turn to take control of the central power and nationally display the said agendas.<sup>3</sup> The clear regional disunity that characterizes postcolonial Ecuador would, thus, be its political expression in these *caudillos* struggles and territorial organization projects based on regional power structures seeking overlap another. One would have to be preoccupied about regional and local implications of joint mechanisms activated by the central power, in terms of territorial and administrative articulation of these entities

1

AYALA, Enrique. *Lucha política y origen de los partidos en Ecuador*. 4th. ed. Quito: Tehis, Corporación Editora Nacional, 1988; CHIRIBOGA, Manuel. *Jornaleros, grandes propietarios y exportación cacaotera, 1790-1925*. 2nd. ed. Quito: UASB-E, Corporación Editora Nacional, 2013; QUINTERO, Rafael. *Ecuador: una nación en ciernes*. Quito: Editorial Universitaria, 1995.

2

AYALA, Enrique. Op. cit., p. 47-49.

3

Idem.

from the so-called "regional displacement".

These considerations gave way later to the preparation of a series of researches dedicated to assess the regional implications in the formation of 19<sup>th</sup> Century State, in the sense of understanding from the regional, institutional mechanisms to build a central power, whose facet depends more on its institutional articulation possibilities other than solely, its control options through the building of the structures of power.

These interpretations, which correspond to the 70s and 80s of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century, were part of an reinterpretation of the Ecuadorian national history so-called "New History of Ecuador", animated by circuits of professional historians that in those years were instrumental to the formation of what later would be identified as "Professionalization of the Ecuadorian historiographical field", many of which were strongly encouraged by the approaches of Marxist history. It will be in the 1990s when this interpretive turn will reach its high point, among the turn on Latin American historical studies from social and economic bases taking into consideration the decisive nature of the region as an element through which the State conformation makes sense and reaches possibly its fullness: State and region are developed so simultaneous and mutual determination that studies regarding the emergence of central power and integration processes Ecuador experienced a renewal.

In the Latin American context, the renewal of historical studies coincides, at the same time, with the development of preoccupations to explain the processes of consolidation of capitalism in the region, and the development of incorporation processes to the national Latin American realities in a subordinate way: dependency, the theories of development by CEPAL, and lately, neoliberalism. These experiences need to be illuminated in the light of the historical processes of long duration.

Therefore, there was the need that the economic and sociopolitical interpretations of these processes were seen structurally and in wide historic panorama, to the proposal to explain historically how the incorporation of Latin America was realized. Question that cannot be solved from the most canonical interpretations of the national historiographies, for which demanded the conformation of a new change, emerging from the universities, within which the resources of professional history allowed the compression of the processes of dependency, crisis and development in Latin American Societies.<sup>4</sup> In this order of things, in the field of the Ecuadorian sociological and economical reflection, flourished important contributions of historical order, which was invited to reflect on mainly the Ecuadorian reality in terms of its regional fragmentation and specificity of these spaces as laboratories in which discussions about galvanization of central power (the State) and the way the fragmented reality consisted in an important foundation for further consolidation. Among these authors outrivals Juan Manguashca.

In the perspective of this researcher, in the study of the construction for the Ecuadorian State as an institution en the 19<sup>th</sup> Century, is legible from institutional attempts of the central government to intervene in the regional space in three dimensions: political and administrative penetration, regulatory standardization, and social inclusion.

The penetration process includes any activity that displays the State and the institutions that it created with the purpose of taking military and administrative control of its national territory. As regards regulatory standardization, this process is related to the desire of the State to create and formulate laws, values and myths

4

It is not the objective of this article to trace the period of the new historiographies. Well not even the extension of this work would allow. It is enough for now, just to mention that the said interpretative renewal seek to give historical sustenance to elaborations like the theory of dependence or to the own reformulations that, on development of North American capitalism, that was proposed from the Marxist and structuralism focus, to which the so called "Nueva Historia" was vigorous inspired. To it was incorporated, later on, regional histories approaches, designed to give explanation to the processes of uneven development of a Latin American realities over others, based on the establishment of mechanisms of territorial integration not always consistent with the later national geographic delineations.

whose purpose is to transform the population into a collective entity. Finally, the third process, the incorporation, has to do with State initiatives aimed at including the political system directly or indirectly marginalized groups.<sup>5</sup> [Translation]

5

TARROW, Sidney. *Between center and periphery: grassroots politicians in Italy and France*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1977. Cit. MAIGUASHCA, Juan. El proceso de integración nacional en el Ecuador: el rol del poder central, 1830-1895. In: \_\_\_\_\_. (ed.). *Historia y región en el Ecuador. 1830-1930*. Quito: Flacso-Ecuador, York University-CERLAC, Instituto Francés de Estudios Andinos (IFEA), Corporación Editora Nacional, 1994, p. 357-358.

This incursion of the State at the local level also reveals the contradictory nature of its commitment ("advancing" in some cases, "backward" in others), which would reveal not only the uniqueness of the raid determined by the particularities of each regional and local level but, especially- and it is in this perspective that I would like to inscribe this reflection-in the *local conditions of receiving* the State penetration effort. This is: the effective mechanisms of negotiation of the local world with the central power.

It is worth saying that this argument implies moving two ideas that appear as "commonalities" in the study of the formation of the Republican State: first, the idea of a movement of a single State that is expressed in a similar manner in all contexts -the State as compact entity, capable of homogeneously coordinate the regional, and local spaces-, opposed to a movement of *multiple* penetration that display, on the contrary, the polemic sense of its' advancement. Second, the idea that this State movement is accomplished only uni-directionally (from the center to the peripheries), *versus* the idea of an exchange of flows between State demands (expressed in legal codes, regulations and values, mechanisms effective incorporation, such as elections, administration of justice, public education, militias, forms of social control or regulation of everyday life) and local practices (values, traditions and customary laws) that are implemented in accordance with said claims .

For every incorporation effort or advancement of central power, there is an local act corresponding to this movement, and vice versa. These dynamics invited, moreover, to put into perspective the social and cultural mechanisms of State reception in the local world through conceptual rehabilitation of historical interpretations on the formation of the Ecuadorian national State in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century.<sup>6</sup>

6

Maiguashca, Juan. *El proceso...*, Op. cit., p. 355 - 420; y: MAIGUASHCA, Juan. Dirigentes, políticos y burócratas: el Estado como institución en los países andinos, entre 1830 y 1890. In: \_\_\_\_\_. (ed.) *Historia de América Andina*, vol. 5. Formación de las repúblicas y formación de la nación. Quito: UASB-E, Libresa. 2003. p. 213 - 273.

I propose here to revisit, preliminarily, the theoretical interpretation of Maiguashca putting it in dialogue (as far as possible) with other similar formulations on the operation of local power and development of the Ecuadorian State in the first half of the nineteenth Century, also in the Republican Brazil. I refer specifically to the contributions of Federica Morelli, Roberto Schwarz and Maria Sylvia de Carvalho Franco.<sup>7</sup>

7

MORELLI, Federica. *Territorio o nación. Reforma y disolución del espacio imperial en Ecuador, 1765-1830*. Madrid: CEPC. 2005; SCHWARZ, Roberto. As ideias fora do lugar. Estudos Cebrap, 3, p. 151-161, 1973; y FRANCO, Maria Sylvia de Carvalho. *As ideias estão no lugar*. Caderno de Debates, São Paulo, 1, 1976, p. 61 - 64.

The contributions of Morelli correspond to the study of local impacts of the disintegration of Spanish monarchical State in the *Audiencia* of Quito and the role of municipalities in the galvanization of what would lately be the Ecuadorian State entity. Its interpretation provides an overview of the reaction mechanisms, adaptation and appropriation of the institutional components that shaped the Bourbon State, in the context of its dissolution. For other part, the works of Schwarz and Franco discuss the ways in which, in the context of peripheral incorporation processes to the nuclear spaces of world capitalism, emerge marginal capitalist expressions whose possibilities of realization depend on the similarity, always unfinished, of the complete ways that maintain in metropolitan centers that originate them. In the Brazilian case, the core of this discussion is in the ways that the liberal ideology acquired its appearance and its compatibility (or not) with profit accumulation mechanisms present in the slave order.<sup>8</sup>

I propose this dialogue with the aim, firstly, to show not so much

8

MARSON, Izabel Andrade; OLIVEIRA, Cecília Helena de S. Introdução. Liberalismo, *monarquia e negócios*: laços de origem. In: \_\_\_\_\_. (orgs.) *Monarquia, liberalismo e negócios no Brasil: 1780-1860*. São Paulo: Edusp, 2013, p. 19.

9

Needless to say, as background, that the contributions of Manguashca have been previously discussed by Roland Anrup and Federica Morelli (whose works we refer to here) See: ANRUP, Roland. El Estado ecuatoriano decimonónico y el proceso de integración nacional. *Procesos*. Quito, 7, 1994, p. 89 - 104. MORELLI, Federica. *¿Regiones o ciudades-regionales? Una revisión del concepto de región: el caso de la Audiencia de Quito*. *Procesos*. Quito, 12, 1998, p. 37 - 42.

10

MORELLI, Federica. *Territorio o nación*, Op. cit., p. 183 - 84.

11

AKEN, Mark Van. La lenta expiración del tributo indígena en el Ecuador. *Cultura*, Quito, VI, 16, 1988, p. 49 - 80.

the way the central power subordinates local administrative structures, especially around municipalities and parish churches; but the forms that the central power takes in grassroots, as a result of negotiations with the structures and values that organize daily life; and highlight their contribution to the formation of the State. Secondly, I seek to situate the vigorous reflection of Manguashca in the broader context of the recent discussions regarding the role of local culture in the formation of the republican states in the Hispanic and Portuguese American contexts.<sup>9</sup> Third, this exercise seeks to combine interpretive models in respect to the formation of Ecuador's structure State-Nation and its antagonisms with the local culture that allow palming of the binary model of center-periphery relations of the sociological matrix which, as argued, is formulated on the artifice of a unique and uniform movement of the "central" administrative structures on a variety of mechanisms of identified local organization, in general, like "peripheral".

### Indigenous communities, taxes, chiefs and intermediaries in the dissolution of the Imperial Space in the Audience of Quito.

The study of the negotiations between the central State and the indigenous communities in Ecuador of the 19th Century still deserve, according to Federica Morelli, a specialized attention. There still persists the interpretation that argues an aggressive destruction of the indigenous councils, as consequence of the independence wars, the regional based conflicts – that runs through the Ecuadoran 19<sup>th</sup> Century history– and the permanency of the system of Indian taxation. On the contrary, these aspects would allow the backing of the structures of local organization of the indigenous peasantry that in moments of social animosity, activated mechanisms of violence and redundant mobilization, so as to maintain intact those local administrative systems, their values and forms of comprehension of the daily life: the popular culture.

[...]. In reality, and at least during the first part of the 19th century, the political instability, the civil wars and especially the survival of the tax system allowed communities to endure and reproduce, clearly letting them the control over the lands which had considerable consequences on governance of independent countries, to the extent that the land was not only for the Indians an economic resource, but also and above all a source of political rights and collective liberties against the State.<sup>10</sup> [Translation]

The question of the indigenous tribute has two aspects: one of the cultural order, the other of property order. It was, on the one hand, of a levy established to demarcate boundaries of ethnic distinction; and a tax burden which tended to establish mechanisms of control over private property.<sup>11</sup> Both factors, far from undermining the local community structure facing the state administrative system in formation, allowed the foundation of powerful milestones of differentiation.

Arguing on the contrary of Ayala's characterization of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century municipality as border between the mestizo and the indigenous world,<sup>12</sup> the indigenous council established by the tax and taking advantage of existing legislation their own mechanisms of distinction-exclusion, as well as inclusion of strangers in pursuit of broader control on community land, facing private land claims as those of extensive litigation between Indians of

12

AYALA, Enrique. El Municipio en el siglo XIX. In: \_\_\_\_\_ . *Ecuador del siglo XIX*. Estado nacional, Ejército, Iglesia y Municipio. Quito: UASB-E, Corporación Editora Nacional. 2011, p. 221 - 39.

13

MORELLI, Federica. *Territorio o nación*, p. 184 - 85. Loreto REBOLLEDO. *Comunidad y resistencia*. El caso de Lumbisí en la Colonia. Quito: Flacso, Abya-Yala, 1992.

14

Idem, p. 184.

Lumbisí and Conception Nuns, or as the Indians of Machachi when Bolivar established the mandatory contribution to the indigenous and administrative division of parcels of community lands, for example.<sup>13</sup>

So, the question of relations between indigenous communities and the Ecuadorian 19<sup>th</sup> Century State can be seen not so much in terms of the mechanisms employed by the central government to incorporate the indigenous world and dissolve it in the wider horizon of the *mestizo* population, through administrative law and the tax system; but from the uses indigenous communities gave to such policy tools as mechanisms of differentiation or maintenance of local forms of reciprocity.

It is not the central power, in this sense, who intends to incorporate then through legal dissolution and tax differentiation, but it is the communities that place themselves in the margins of incorporation effort through transactions and negotiations against the implementation of centralizing mechanisms of territorial administration, and control tax on the population.

What this interpretation leaves at hand is the emphasis on the processes of appropriation efforts by the central power for local insertion. The resort to Indian tribute as social differentiation, the use of the implementation of territorial administration processes in parts, and then through the legal bodies that relates to the division of the national space; and mainstreaming strategy of incorporating outsiders to the communities, open as a possibility by State legislation (social inclusion), all within the framework of political turmoil and war, gives an idea on the tactical ability of the communities, according to Morelli, to "[...] adapt to new legal situations and take advantage of them."<sup>14</sup>

"Take advantage" appears as a means of leveraging local identity in a context in which the social and political violence are factors of particularly threatening to the universal community; but also an exceptional threshold, on the one hand, reshaping relations between the local world and the central government, through negotiations seeking a type of peripheral incorporation mediated by partners (State officials, local clergy, community chiefs or heads of local militia) who act as hermeneutical hinges between the central government and the local world; on the other hand, it involves to appreciate the efforts of disintegration (from the perspective of central power) of local space, and re-composition (from the perspective of local authorities) of territory in ethnic terms.

For example, the rebellion of Daquilema, referred by Morelli as a witness case that reinforces the idea of a clearly defined ethnic territory, was a successful indigenous peasant mobilization with very vigorous local dynamic, and favors the idea that the state efforts of penetration and peripheral incorporation bring, against the grain, dynamics of strengthening local values.

### State as "Institution" and the role of central power in the state training (1830-1895)

Based on the works of Tarrow, Maiguashca, characterized the institutional effort of central power in Ecuador and its penetration in local space in the 19<sup>th</sup> century. In his contribution, the progress of the central power is performed by three movements: political-administrative penetration (related to the actions taken by the State, and institutions created to control

administrative and militarily the country); regulatory standardization (the need to produce laws, myths and values, elements that establish a community of individuals from shared symbols and rituals); and social inclusion (through the expansion of the electoral stain and access to voting).<sup>15</sup>

This triple movement, territorial and "inwards", allows the perception of all kinds of contributions that the central government made in its institutional dimension, to articulate the countryside around to the spatial core from the first decades of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century. In this sense, Maiguashca tells us –following Manfred Kossok– that the State in Ecuador is not so much a consequence of the national formation, but "its instrument."<sup>16</sup>

15  
MAIGUASHCA, Juan. *El proceso...*, Op. cit., p. 357 - 359.

The central argument of Maiguashca points to the incongruous development of 19<sup>th</sup> Century Latin American State. I expand a bit on this. The study of the development of the central powers in the early context of Latin American republicanism may, according to his view, be undertaken in two dimensions: as an apparatus of domination, and as an administrative structure. Both sides not always maintain mutual coherence in development or go together; it would be, according Maiguashca, a rear occurrence. On the contrary, in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century Spanish American context it is possible to find State formulations with a strong component of political and military domination (of strongman outfit) but with a still embryonic administrative structure; or State expressions with a very definite administrative component (with a bureaucratic framework that seeks to "take place" among other corporate structures –Church and municipalities, for example) even when its character of domination (monopoly of arms and effective territorial control) is not fully developed. "There have been cases in which the relation of social domination is not yet properly developed and yet, immediate needs of the society, such as those of maintaining peace and order, have demanded the presence and the development of a State apparatus."<sup>17</sup>

16  
Idem, p. 356.

Therefore, for Maiguashca, the key player in the formation of the State as an institution is not exactly the warlords (traditionally identified as a "mark of the period"), but political leaders and bureaucratic elites.<sup>18</sup>

[...]. This type of analysis is necessary because, generally, when speaking of government staff vague or too broad concepts as ruling classes, well-off classes, propertied classes, political elites, powerful, etc., a step forward was made when the distinction between "ruling classes" and "ruling class" was proposed. But we believe this is not enough and we see the need to go further and propose further distinctions, as there are leaders of economic, social, cultural and political life.<sup>19</sup> [Translation]

17  
Idem, p. 357.

By stimulating the development of State personnel, the central government strengthened its links with the peripheries "inwards" and, in doing so, delineates its surrounding "outwards", that is to say, establishes its differentiation with other national States through the incorporation of the local areas to its territorial and administrative center; so as to develop, its mechanisms of external links.

18  
Idem, p. 359.

This would explain, in the Ecuadorian case, the attempt to de-construct the former territorial administrations councils by fragmenting their jurisdictions, using in this case municipal legislation, so as to create new dependent administrative bodies of the central government and not regional powers; in this way, increasing the central bureaucracy.

19  
MAIGUASHCA, Juan. *Dirigentes, políticos y burócratas...*, Op. cit., p. 213 - 214.

The Law on Territorial Division of 1824 expressed this commitment and catalyzed, in the following years, local conflicts derived from regula-

tion of the processes of judicial administration and justice, mechanisms of social organization of local life, as well as the emergence of new administrative entities "clutter" or "readapted" to the administrative forms previous to the law (that is to say, the creation of new municipalities as a regulation mechanism of territorial influence, judicial, legal and policy of the former municipalities). The legal articulation enacted in 1824 established an administrative and jurisdictional mechanism based on the old colonial administration structure, but defining the scope of municipal corporations, and creating new administrative spaces, while suppressing local ecclesiastical task to municipal jurisdiction.

The fragmentation of the old administrative units, in the perspective of deconstructing regional powers, faced conflicts and tensions that emerged sometimes as veiled warnings to the central power. The difficulties left out by the Act itself, the apparent contrapositions in the articulation itself relative to the creation of new municipalities, the eventual establishment of municipalities or the possibility of articulating judicially with other municipalities, for electoral and administrative purposes, in these new spaces gave rise to claims and wiles to exit from the regional and local worlds.

### **Municipalities and Central Power: tensions, negotiations and accommodations**

According to Federica Morelli, the period immediately preceding that which here we refer to as the municipal corporation, initially invigorated thanks to the Bourbon Reforms after the constitutional process opened by the Cadiz experience; and including the years of the Colombian confederation, its role concerning the processing of citizenship was strengthened.<sup>20</sup> That role was made possible only from representation mechanisms modeled by local corporations, which transfigured in the singular development tool in the construction processes of constitutional citizenship.

The financial hardship, the demographic debacle caused by the war, and the natural disasters experienced in the territory, together with the process rural transformation of the most important urban enclaves during the constitutional period - and even later during *bolivarians* liberation campaigns - helped to scatter spirit of municipality in an effort to mark the presence of the Colombian central power in a territory which, as noted elsewhere by Ana Buriano, prioritized the internal disconnect. Regional ties of the northern highlands with the area of *neogranadino* was invigorated, also those of the region under the dominance of Cuenca and the port of Guayaquil with the northern Peru; and the region of Loja and Southeast developed unusual federalists efforts.<sup>21</sup>

Both the old council as the Cadiz municipality showed themselves as administrative bodies of greater force, to the point that served as boosters of the colonial State and the Republic in its early years, although in subsequent tensions between the old corporation and the central power in the struggle for expansion those bodies gained different nuances:

The political structure created by Bolivar needed a reform of the territorial organization, carried out by defining departments, provinces and cantons in the Territorial Division Act of 1824, which divided the entire territory of the Great Colombia- Colombia, Ecuador, Panama and Venezuela -in 12 departments, 36 provinces and 228 cantons. The aim was to create administrative units lesser extent in order to streamline the

20  
MORELLI, Federica. *Territorio o nación...*, Op. cit.

21  
BURIANO, Ana. *Navegando en la borrasca. Construir la nación de la fe en el mundo de la impiedad*. Ecuador, 1860 - 1875. México: Instituto Mora. 2008. EGUIGUREN VALDIVIESO, Genaro. *El gobierno Federal de Loja: la crisis de 1858*. Quito: Municipio de Loja, Corporación Editora Nacional, 1992.



administration and centralize power. But as in Cadiz, the reform did not follow a geometric spirit like the French way, and the territory was not divided into a set of suitable homogeneous administrative units to break the old social ties and transform the aggregate groups of individuals-citizens. Indeed, the departments corresponded to the old provincial areas dominated by the major cities, while the provinces took over spaces that were once dominated by medium-sized cities. Therefore, only the creation of cantons (districts), not corresponding to the colonial councils or with constitutional councils, was a novelty.<sup>22</sup> [Translation]

22

MORELLI, Federica. *Territorio o nación...*, Op. cit., p. 250.

23

See Idem. A detailed description of the operation of the 19th Century municipalities can be found in AYALA, Enrique. Ecuador del siglo XIX..., Op. cit. An investigation realized by Ecuadorian historian Rosario Coronel illustrates the case of the region of Riobamba at the end of the 18th Century and the beginning of the 19th Century, the municipal role as a space of expression of the local powers and the scenario of negotiations with the central power before its efforts of administrative control. Specifically, her work evidences the State efforts to control the indigenous manual labor and the administration of the work known as "community lands" (tierras de comunidad). The efforts of centralization were not clear when it did not involve dealing with the indigenous Chiefs, mayors of the indigenous groups and their own municipal structure. See: CORONEL, Rosario. *Poder local en la transición de la colonia a la república*. Riobamba 1750-1820. 2009. 328f. Thesis (Doctorate in Latin American History). Área de Historia, Universidad Andina Simón Bolívar, Sede Ecuador, Quito, 2009. See also: \_\_\_\_\_. *Poder local entre la colonia y la república*. Riobamba, 1750-1812. Quito: UASB-E / Corporación Editora Nacional, 2015, p. 209 - 231.

23

We do not have enough space here to give the details of the dynamics. It is enough the submission to the reader, for now, the Works of Federica Morelli (as far as the topic of judiciary is concerned) and Antonio Annino (on issues on elections in the local levels). MORELLI, Federica. *Pueblos, alcaldes y municipios: la justicia local en el mundo hispánico entre Antiguo Régimen y Liberalismo*. Historia Crítica, Bogotá, 35, julio-diciembre 2008, p. 37 - 58; ANNINO, Antonio (coord.). *Historia de las elecciones en Iberoamérica, siglo XIX*. Buenos Aires: FCE, 1995.

24

MORELLI, Federica. *Territorio o nación...*, Op. cit., p. 202. \_\_\_\_\_. *Pueblos, alcaldes y municipios...*, Op. cit., p. 36 - 57.

As if that was not enough, a sustained effort to form bureaucrats was put in place so as to establish direct control of state administrative activities (through municipalities, provincial headquarters and parish holdings) affected by the municipal bodies: police administration and justice, collection fees and taxes, control of manual labor, contributions of the indigenous - Indian tribute - and their work on communal lands, among others, and parish churches (registration of citizens through baptismal records, management of marriage contract and coercion when the marriage commitment was breached, after paying dowry). It not always the case that the State manage to impose itself and an administrative and political negotiation was established.<sup>23</sup> The arenas in which these tensions, negotiations and accommodations emerged were especially the electoral and legal-administrative.<sup>22</sup>

When referring to the functioning of the administration of justice in the *Audience of Quito*, and subsequent phases prior to the peninsular crises, the independence wars and the integration of Ecuadorian territorial space to the Colombian federation, Morelli makes it clear that the State operation in legal matters was always determined by the sociocultural conditions of the local world, the application of justice and the functioning of the courts.

The structure of justice therefore suggests the image of a weak central power of peripheral and effectiveness in fact forced to accept that justice be imparted according to local codes of behavior; which, in turn implied a strengthening of the pluralistic idea of sovereignty is that, for collective mentality, exercise, involving the administration of justice in all spheres of social life, still possessed a very specific character.<sup>24</sup> (Translation)

### The State as an Institution, domination and patterns of power

The work of Manguashca is an invitation to look at the development of structure Latin American 19<sup>th</sup> Century State in their movements and tensions with the local power; however, I think his approach has three limitations.

In the first place, although in educational terms the development of the State can be divided into two facets (as an apparatus of domination and as an administrative entity), both dimensions are actually intertwined, and form part of a single movement; i.e. that every effort of administrative incorporation (or functional) of the physical space (or territorial) is the same determination of domination which presumes levels of confrontation, veiled (through the struggle for control of the mechanisms of representation of local power - municipal councils, judges of the peace or los church authorities-) and demonstrations (armed conflicts, regional and local rebellions), and the emergence of tactical mechanisms to eliminate them. In reality any administrative act is in itself an act of power, an attempt of domination.

In the second place, the analysis of Manguashca of a triple mechanism penetration of central power in the local levels privileges relations between municipality (represented in provincial and municipal councils) and the cen-

tral power (embodied in the local bureaucracy: chiefs and political commissioners), abolishing the role of the parish church and disassembling the relation that it maintains with the municipality.

Hence the image from Tarrow, the figure of the local power looks rigid, given that it illuminates the kind of State mechanisms of penetration (collection of laws, symbols, values and myths promoted as national ideals, and successive enlargements of the electoral spot) disregards the relationships interwoven in the local world, i.e. the composition of local government, its relations, operations and negotiations regarding the provincial, departmental, municipal and district government; and especially the role of religious values and rituals in the building political ideals and its influence on local practices.

Thus, the focus on administrative State penetration, proposed by Maiguashca, makes rigid the relations between the central government and local authorities, considering them as given entities, a fact that actually meets the objective of providing a first and useful picture to the State contribution to national integration, and contributes little to appreciate in details its structure, internal operation and the type of underlying conflicts in the political struggle of the first decades of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century that, as demonstrated by French historians Marie-Danielle Demelas and Yves Saint-Geours, adopted a distinctly religious aspect. "[...] Delegated to build the nation, having to forge a unifying symbol and define a civil society, the leaders preferred less 'armed people' to the Christian people."<sup>25</sup>

In the case of Ecuador in 19<sup>th</sup> Century, Catholic ideals used to function as social and political binder factor, with the notion of "people of God". The role of the local church was - as we know - decisive in the formation of such ideal not only from an administrative perspective, but also in the adaptation and assimilation of the circulating political languages.<sup>26</sup>

Thus considered, the study of State formation in Ecuador in 19<sup>th</sup> Century commented here is contained in a cyclic descriptive model of movement that presumes the existence of a production center of legal mechanisms, regulatory and symbolic mechanisms of the *first order* in which political-administrative languages are generated; and the existence of a peripheral receiving space of the *second order*, or subordinated, wherein said meanings are consumed (the space of meaning).

The works of Brazilian scholars Roberto Schwarz and Maria Sylvia de Carvalho Franco provides, according to my reading, analytical tools to reconsider the theoretical contribution of Maiguashca in the aforementioned terms. Obviously, the discussion that animates these scholars<sup>27</sup> brings us to the formation of the national State in Brazil in the late 19<sup>th</sup> Century, and concretely to the discussion on the rise of liberalism and its relationship with local slavery structures.<sup>28</sup>

The discussion on the production, circulation and appropriation of political languages ("ideas", in the reflection of Schwarz and Carvalho) from a given space of production meanings towards "peripheral" scenarios of subordination; and the interpretation of mechanisms of the consumption processes of political speeches in the local context, makes it possible to examine the theoretical approach based on reception dynamics center-periphery, towards a more flexible model of analysis that uncovers the appropriations the political languages in the local world and the role of popular culture in its redefinition. That is to say the *multiplicity of states* that arises in local contexts, as a result of assimilation or adaptation of the univocal mecha-

25

DEMÉLAS, Marie-Danielle; SAINT-GEOURS, Yves. *Jerusalén y Babilonia*. Religión y política en el Ecuador 1780-1880. Quito: IFEA, Corporación Editora Nacional, 1988, p. 16.

26

The registration of faithful in the parish through baptismal records, its role in the activities of property transfer through marriage contracts or direct intervention in the political arena, through positions and functions in municipal councils and cantonal.

27

A sophisticated theory consideration of the contributions of these scholars has been developed by: PALTÍ, Elías José. *El tiempo de la política*. El siglo XIX reconsiderado. Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI Editores, 2007, p. 259 - 308.

nisms of state penetration.

The approach allows reconsidering the formation of the national State structure in Ecuador 19<sup>th</sup> Century while warning that the attempt to insert the State in the local world reflects, more than a movement of peripheral incorporation of subordination, an appropriation in which the scaffold of the embryonic State "paves way" between the two administrative entities and power (corporations) that are well consolidated: the municipality and the church, so as to take advantage of its structure and translate itself into local codes. This opens way to the conceptual formulation that the *single* movement of the central power triggers the formation of *multiples* state expressions.

### Dislocations and adjustments in the Center – Periphery dynamics

Roberto Schwarz's work, published in 1973, constituted, in the words of Elias J. Palti, an effort to "[...] translate from the Cultural point of view the postulates of the so-called 'dependency theory'";<sup>29</sup> in this sense, the reflection developed by the Brazilian scholar emphasized the foreign character of the ideas to interpret the Brazilian reality.

Reediting the debate between Schwarz and Franco, Palti revisits both contributions to present them as a contradictory effort (in a dialectical sense) articulated by analyzing the processes of adaptation and assimilation of political languages in the field of popular culture, demonstrating not so much the mechanisms of circulation of ideas (the most obvious spectrum of the two contributions), as far as the problem of sensibilities that produces its appropriation and pragmatic reformulations that this movement implies.

From seemingly opposite sides, Schwarz and Franco touch in nodal way the same problematical point of the dynamics of production and consumption of ideas, speeches and political languages: the re-signification of its potential through its entanglements in the local culture. The specific nature of Brazilian cultural reality would reside, precisely, in the mismatch between circulating ideas and conditions peripheral space in which they are appropriate, resulting in a semiotic sense, dislocations of semantics nature between the kinds of speeches that announce their meaning, and the sense that trigger when they are adapted in the periphery. These disparities are evident, according to Schwarz, between the European liberal ideas and slavery character of the Brazilian society of the nineteenth Century:

It is clear that the labor freedom, equality before the law and, in general, universalism were also ideologies in Europe; but there it corresponded to appearances, covering up the essentials - the exploitation of labor. Among us, the same ideas would be false in a different sense, so to speak, original.<sup>30</sup>

It highlights two aspects that deserve to be emphasized: the character in "foreign" appearance and therefore "disconnected" from the political ideas generated in Europe (which refers us to the notion of "habitat", or conditions under which discourse and languages are generate and fully function), as referred to previously; and the "diverse" character and "original" of the falsity of those ideas when they are adapted in the periphery (i.e. that the Brazilian and Latin American specificity, by extension would be precisely the different and original adaptations to "not-places" that generate the consumption of ideas produced in metropolitan contexts).

The approach of Schwarz, against the grain, would constitute an in-

30  
SCHWARZ, Roberto. *As idéias fora do lugar*, Op. cit., p. 151.

interpretative proposal not so much of the type of subordination that the circulation of ideas and speeches generated (in center-periphery meaning), but of the ability of the peripheries to adapt "distortedly" elements to their own realities. This in fact does not resolve the dichotomy production-consumption / center-periphery, permits the inversion, at least, of the focus of analysis, not so much to appreciate how ideas are produced, but the type of rootedness that there are in different scenarios, although these may always be apparently deformed, as Schwarz puts it.<sup>31</sup>

Thus, the adaptation of political discourse generated at a center that is capable of producing meanings, and a set of peripheries with option to consume them (adapt them) in different ways, but counterfeited, evidences the conditions of subordination of local spaces within which the possibilities of meaning - regarding the flow of ideas - are limited to their inaccurate adjustment.

From this perspective, it is possible to formulate the hypothesis that, in the model of State formation in nineteenth Century in Ecuador proposed by Maiguashca, and here interrogated through the contributions of Schwarz, the mechanisms of State penetration rises out of place, since the incorporation of territorial and administrative peripheries produce "counterfeited" forms of attachment, or half-incorporations. All of which could lead us to appeal to the success of the route of the central power in Ecuador as a process of incorporation too, "counterfeited", and its institutional contribution to the formation of the Ecuadorian nation as inconclusive, given the "limited conditions" of its reception, against the evidence of local mechanisms of conformation of power, and the organization of the mechanisms of reciprocity.

In her studies of the Brazilian slave society, Maria Sylvania de Carvalho Franco subjected to scrutiny the center-periphery relation model presented in the reflection of Roberto Schwarz.<sup>32</sup> Franco challenged the existence of a logical flow of ideas generated in essential form in a determined conceptual and geographical area (Europe), and thus the peripheral character of the Brazilian capitalist development, to show that there is no lateness or inconsistencies between liberalism and slave society in Brazil; on the contrary: there exists a nuclear link between the two, since that arises (and was not assimilated), and acquires specific forms here, where the foundation of capitalism manages to express itself:

[...] colony and metropolis do not essentially run different modes of production, although particular situations which are determined in the *internal* process of differentiation of the world capitalist system, in its immanent movement of its constitution and reproduction. Each is particularly developed, parts of the capitalist system, but both carry within an essential substance-the-profit- that runs all its determinations. Thus, the production and circulation of ideas can only be conceived as internationally determined, but with the thought of world capitalism as indicated above, without the analytical dissociation of its parts.<sup>33</sup> (*Translation*)

32  
FRANCO, Maria Sylvania de Carvalho. *As idéias estão no lugar*, Op. cit., p. 61 - 64.

Thus, according to Carvalho, ideas, languages and political discourse are never "out of place", but take morphologies and different meanings in the context in which they arise, what happens when the conditions that allows germination are presented.<sup>34</sup>

The challenging of her interpretation, I think, resides in highlighting the ability that local culture has to assimilate certain speeches and ideas, and translate them into their own language, according to their own pos-

33  
Idem, p. 62.

34  
PALTÍ, Elías. *El tiempo de la política...*, Op. cit., Apéndice.

35  
See: MAIGUASHCA, Juan. *Dirigentes, políticos y burócratas...*, Op. cit.; and GARAVAGLIA, Juan Carlos. *Servir al Estado, servir al poder: la burocracia en el proceso de construcción estatal en América Latina*. Almanack, Guarulhos, 3, maio 2012, p. 5 - 26.

36  
In related studies, in the Ecuadorian case, it's obligatory to mention the two efforts: that of Rosario Coronel, referred to already and the works of Andrés Guerrero on the operations of the political officials and their relations with the power structures in the community of Otavalo. CORONEL, Rosario. *Los indios de Riobamba y la revolución de Quito*. Procesos. Revista ecuatoriana de Historia, Quito, 30, II semestre 2009, p. 109 - 123. GUERRERO, Andrés. *Curagas y tenientes políticos: la ley de la costumbre y la ley del Estado (Otavalo 1830-1875)*, and: GUERRERO, Andrés. *Los protectores de indios republicanos, el historiador y el archivo: una hermenéutica de las representaciones judiciales*. In: \_\_\_\_\_. *Administración de poblaciones, ventriloquia y transcripción: análisis teóricos estudios teóricos*. Quito: Flacso-Ecuador, IEP, 2010, p. 17 - 99; p. 239 - 319.

sibilities of meaning. Thus, the Brazilian capitalism, in her reading, would not be a dependent consequence due to the consolidation of metropolitan capitalism, in a relationship of externality, but an expression typical of its development, depending on the given conditions of the slavery system and the relations of favor.

The assessment of Carvalho to the reflection made by Schwarz could illuminate, in turn, some aspects of the theoretical model developed by Maiguashca to study the role of the State as an institution in the formation of the Ecuadorian nation in the 19th Century, focusing on the role of local culture in the assimilation of the mechanisms of central incorporation that acquire a different dynamic and, at the same time, similar in each context?

### From a State Project in motion to a multiple reception of its forms of peripheral incorporation

The combination of contributions discussed here open up possibilities of studying the formation of the State in the Ecuador in a double sense: "completing the picture", in other words, in as far as the study of the efforts of State penetration viewed from institutional terms; but also putting in perspective the different forms in which this penetration got its expression in the local world. This may also contribute to the study of the processes of State formation in Latin America considering not only the institutional efforts of central power to articulate the local space within a common imaginary of values and myths, laws and bureaucratic structures, or by means of the amplification of voter participation in the relocation of the jurisdictional beacons and delivery of Justice; but also the role of popular culture in the formation of the State, and the ties that the administrative practices and local operation "unwritten" maintain with the ideas and political languages.

A historiography of liberal style that largely constitutes the common bed of interpretations of the period, on the basement of the *caudillismo* as an explanation of the evolution of political culture and the regional dynamics, eludes analytical questions arising from evidence of practices, knowledges, behaviors and ways in which the values, laws and State myths were appropriate in local contexts, or the form in which these appropriations became contributions of local culture to the forging of national State project and its operation.

Another question that may arise from this rethinking has to do with administrative outline of the 19th Century State of Ecuador, in the sense of the formation of the subjects of the State, i.e., the bureaucracies. There have been advances of solid contributions to the study of the integration of the bureaucratic clusters in the Andean and Latin American world, from the perspective of its relations with the central Government, or as their representatives in the local worlds.<sup>35</sup>

In the Ecuadorian case, there still lacks explorations that would analyze the way in which the former leaders (Chiefs or warlords) joined the central power as State officials, entered into negotiations with the representatives of the central power, questioned their roles or interpreted both roles themselves.<sup>36</sup> All of which repositions the reflection on the ways in which State penetration is made in peripheral spaces in an institutional perspective on the horizon of the study of the conditions that peripheries created to negotiate the ways in which the central power are translated into local terms.

## Bibliography

### Primary sources

Ley de División Territorial de la República de Colombia (1824). In: Gaceta de Colombia Bogotá, 142, domingo 4 de julio de 1824.

NOBOA, Aurelio. Recopilación de leyes de la República del Ecuador. Tomo I. Constituciones. Quito: Imprenta Nacional, 1898.

### Secondary sources

ANNINO, Antonio. Historia de las elecciones en Iberoamérica siglo XIX. Buenos Aires: FCE, 1995.

ANRUP, Roland. El estado ecuatoriano decimonónico y el proceso de integración nacional. Procesos, 7, 1995.

AKEN, Mark Van. La lenta expiración del tributo indígena en el Ecuador. Cultura, Quito, VI, 2, 1988.

AYALA MORA, Enrique. Ecuador del siglo XIX. Estado nacional, ejército, Iglesia y municipio. Quito: UASB-E – Corporación Editora Nacional, 2011.

\_\_\_\_\_. Historia de la Revolución Liberal Ecuatoriana. 2ª.ed.. Quito: Tehis, Corporación Editora Nacional, 2002.

\_\_\_\_\_. Lucha política y origen de los partidos en Ecuador. 4ª.ed.. Quito: Tehis, Corporación Editora Nacional, 1988.

BURIANO, Ana. Navegando en la borrasca. Construir la nación de la fe en el mundo de la impiedad, Ecuador; 1860-1875. México: Instituto Mora. 2008

CORONEL, Rosario. Poder local entre la colonia y la república. Riobamba, 1750-1812. Quito: UASB-E / Corporación Editora Nacional, 2015.

\_\_\_\_\_. Los indios de Riobamba y la Revolución de Quito, 1757-1814. Procesos: revista ecuatoriana de historia, Quito, 30, 2º. semestre 2009.

\_\_\_\_\_. Poder local en la transición de la colonia a la república: Riobamba 1750-1820. Tese (Programa de Doctorado en Historia Latinoamericana). Universidad Andina Simón Bolívar, Sede Ecuador, Quito, 2009.

EGUIGUREN, Genaro. El Gobierno Federal de Loja: la crisis de 1858. Quito: Municipio de Loja, Corporación Editora Nacional, 1992.

FRANCO, Maria Sylvia de Carvalho. As ideias estão no lugar. Caderno de Debates, 1, São Paulo, Brasilense, 1976.

\_\_\_\_\_. Homens livres na ordem escravocrata. São Paulo: Unesp, 1997.

GARAVAGLIA, Juan Carlos. Servir al Estado, servir al poder: la burocracia en el proceso de construcción estatal en América Latina. Almanack, Guarulhos, 3, maio 2012.

GUERRERO, Andrés. Administración de poblaciones, ventriloquia y transescritura. Quito: Flacso-Ecuador, IEP, 2010.

- MAIGUASHCA, Juan. Dirigentes, políticos y burócratas: el Estado como institución en los países andinos, entre 1830 y 1890. In: \_\_\_\_\_ (ed.). Historia de América Andina, vol. 5. Creación de las repúblicas y formación de la nación. Quito: UASB-E, Libresa, 2003.
- \_\_\_\_\_. El proceso de integración nacional en el Ecuador: el rol del poder central, 1830 – 1895. In: \_\_\_\_\_ (ed.). Historia y Región en el Ecuador: 1830-1890. Quito: Flacso-CERLAC IV, Corporación Editora Nacional, IFEA, 1994.
- MARSON, Izabel Andrade; OLIVEIRA, Cecília Helena de Salles (orgs.). Monarquía, liberalismo e negócios no Brasil: 1780-1860. São Paulo: Edusp, 2013.
- MORELLI, Federica. Entre confianza y armas. La justicia local en Ecuador del Antiguo Régimen al liberalismo. Revista Complutense de Historia de América, Madrid, 37, 2011.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Pueblos, alcaldes y municipios: la justicia local en el mundo hispanico entre Antiguo Régimen y Liberalismo. Historia Crítica, Bogotá, 36, julio – diciembre 2008.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Territorio o nación. Reforma y disolución del espacio imperial en el Ecuador. 1765 – 1830. Madrid: CEPC, 2005.
- \_\_\_\_\_. ¿Regiones o ciudades-regionales? Una revisión del concepto de región: el caso de la Audiencia de Quito, 1765-1809. Procesos: revista ecuatoriana de Historia, 12, 1998.
- PALTI, Elias J. El tiempo de la política. El siglo XIX reconsiderado. Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI Editores Argentina, 2007.
- REBOLLEDO, Loreto. Comunidad y resistencia. El caso de Lumbisí en la Colonia. Quito: Flacso – Abya-Yala, 1992.
- SAWYER, Derek. Formas cotidianas de formación del estado: algunos comentarios disidentes acerca de la "hegemonía. JOSEPH, Gilbert M.; NUGENT, Daniel (comps.). Aspectos cotidianos en la formación del Estado. México: Ediciones Era, 2002.
- SCHWARZ, Roberto. As ideias fora do lugar. Estudos Cebrap, 3, 1973.
- TARROW, Sidney. Between center and periphery: grassroots politicians in Italy and France. New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1977.