ARTICLES

The Gospel of Matthew and the History of Reading in Brazilian Bible Editions / O evangelho de Mateus e a história da leitura em edições bíblicas brasileiras

João Leonel*

ABSTRACT

The gospel of Matthew is one of the most beloved and studied gospels in Christianity, having a rich history of reception. The purpose of this paper is to article study its reading in Brazil from selected intertitles in two biblical versions. The research aims to identify how the gospel has been received by Brazilian editors and readers and how editorial intertitles can provide evidence of such reception. In order to achieve such objective, the history of reading and the history of the book are used as references, based on theories by Roger Chartier (2001, 2002, 2022), Robert Darnton (2010), Lucien Febvre and Henri-Jean Martin (2017), Gerard Genette (1997) and D.F. McKenzie (2018).

KEYWORDS: Gospel of Matthew; History of Reading; History of the Book; Intertitles; Brazilian readers

RESUMO

O evangelho de Mateus é um dos mais queridos e estudados evangelhos do cristianismo, possuindo uma rica história de recepção. Este artigo estuda sua leitura no Brasil a partir de intertítulos selecionados em duas versões bíblicas. A pesquisa procura identificar como o evangelho tem sido recebido por editores e leitores brasileiros e como intertítulos editoriais podem fornecer indícios de tal recepção. Para tanto, são utilizados como referenciais teóricos a história da leitura e a história do livro segundo as obras de Roger Chartier (2001, 2002, 2022), Robert Darnton (2010), Lucien Febvre e Henri-Jean Martin (2017), Gerard Genette (2009) e D. F. Mckenzie (2018).

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: Evangelho de Mateus; História da Leitura; História do Livro; Intertítulos; Leitores brasileiros

Introduction

The Gospel of Matthew has a prominent place in the biblical canon. The first of the four gospels, it opens the New Testament. This is probably due to the fact that it was considered, by the early Christians, the oldest Gospel¹ and also because it functions as a kind of transition between and Old and the New Testaments.

The Gospel of Matthew has a rich reception history, the most read and appreciated by Christians of all times. Among the texts that appear only in this gospel and render it a notable place are: the report of the kings that came to Jerusalem in search for the newborn king of the Jews, the Sermon on the Mount and the famous sentence "That thou art Peter; and upon this rock I will build my church [...]."²

According to Brian Matz, "Matthew may well have been the Gospel most commented upon in the patristic era" (2020, column 130). Ian Boxall summarizes the influence of the Gospel in arts:

In later centuries, scenes unique to Matthew, such as the magi worshipping the infant Jesus (2.1–12), the giving of the keys of the kingdom to Simon Peter (16.18 –19) or the story of the soldiers guarding Jesus' tomb (27.62–66; 28.11–15), would inspire artists in their visual interpretations of the biblical text. Famous examples include The Adoration of the Magi by Botticelli (c.1475 – 6; Uffizi, Florence) and Rembrandt (1632; Hermitage, St Petersburg), Pietro Perugino's fresco The Delivery of the Keys (c. 1481–2; Sistine Chapel, Rome) and The Resurrection by Piero della Francesca (c.1463 –5; Museo Civico, Sansepolcro). Artists have also been inspired by the figure of the evangelist himself and his part in the story he recounts. The Church of San Luigi dei Francesi in Rome contains three canvases by Caravaggio, depicting The Calling of St Matthew, The Inspiration of St Matthew and The Martyrdom of St Matthew. Musically, the most famous interpretation of Matthew's account of Jesus' suffering and death is probably Johann Sebastian Bach's St Matthew Passion (Boxall, 2014, p. 2).

In the academic context, such gospel has been the object of several theoretical connections that go through traditional interpretations and religious hermeneutics, as well as social and anthropological analyses. It is also been propelled by literary and linguistic avenues, among others (Leonel, 2013, pp. 29-66; Boxall, 2014).

¹ Nowadays this theory has fallen into disrepute, and the Gospel of Mark is considered as the oldest one, and as one of the sources for the productions of the Gospels of Matthew and Luke.

² BIBLE. *The King James Version of the Holy Bible*. Available at: <u>www.holybooks.com</u>. Access on November, 03, 2023.

More recently, the history of reading has been applied to the study of biblical texts and, particularly, to the Gospel of Matthew. There is a rich tradition of the reception of the first gospel in the European and in the US contexts. (Boxall, 2018; Novakovic, 2020, columns 123-164). Such research is incipient in Brazil. Therefore, this paper proposes a comparative analysis of the subtitles in two editions of the Gospel of Matthew, in order to minimally fill this gap. The choice of the *corpus* includes the following biblical edition: *BÍBLIA Sagrada*. *Traduzida por João Ferreira de Almeida*. *Nova Almeida Atualizada*. *Barueri*, *SP: Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil*, 2017 [HOLY Bible. Translate by João Ferreira de Almeida. New Almeida Updated. Barueri, SP: Brazilian Biblical Society, 2017]. In order to give more emphasis on the alterations incorporated to this edition, it will be compared with the previous version: *BÍBLIA Sagrada*. 2. ed. Traduzida João Ferreira de Almeida. Revista e Atualizada. Barueri, SP: Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil, second edition, published in 1993 [HOLY Bible. 2nd Edition. Translated by João Ferreira de Almeida. Revised and Updated. Barueri, SP: Brazilian Biblical Society]

Such comparative procedure is justified by the fact that the editors of *Nova Almeida* explicitly affirmed that "(...) *Nova Almeida Atualizada* (...) results from a careful revision and updating of the well-established Almeida's translation, especially in the text of *Almeida Revista e Atualizada*" (Apresentação, 2017, p. IV, emphasis in the original).³

The analyses focus on editorial strategies, which aims at proposing hypotheses associated, firstly, with the biblical text read by the editors themselves,⁴ manifested in different forms in the paratexts⁵ created by them, and, specially, with the readers' configuration⁶ of the gospel, presented particularly in the subtitles. Although the editors'

³ In Portuguese: "(...) a *Nova Almeida Atualizada* (...) resulta de uma profunda revisão e atualização da consagrada tradução de Almeida, particularmente do texto da *Almeida Revista e Atualizada*."

⁴ I make use of the plural form, with no names, as the biblical editions studied herein do not identify the editors.

⁵ Gérard Genette defines paratext: "A literary work consists, entirely or essentially, of a text, defined (very minimally) as a more or less long sequence of verbal statements that are more or less endowed with significance. But this text is rarely presented in an unadorned state, unreinforced and unaccompanied by a certain number of verbal or other productions, such as an author's name, a title, a preface, illustrations. And although we do not always know whether these productions are to be regarded as belonging to the text, in any case they surround it and extend it, precisely in order to *present* it, in the usual sense of this verb but also in the strongest sense: to *make present*, to ensure the text's presence in the world, its 'reception' and consumption in the form (nowadays, at least) of a book. These accompanying productions, which vary in extent and appearance, constitute what I have called elsewhere the work's *paratext*" (Genette, 1997, p. 1). GENETTE, Gérdad. *Paratexts*: Thresholds of Interpretation. Translated by Jane E. Lewin. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.

⁶ I use Roger Chartier's proposal that the editor, by means of typographic objects, inscribes in the work the representation of reading competences of the target audience (Chartier, 2001, p. 98). We take into

reading is perceptible in the paratexts and, therefore, should not be disregarded, the focus, for the purposes of this paper, is on the profile of readers which can be inferred from the paratextual elements.

As theoretical reference, the history of the book is added to the history of reading (Chartier, 2001, 2002, 2022; Darnton, 2010; Febvre; Martin, 2017; Mckenzie, 2018), as "the modes of text inscription, book format, pagination, illustrations, graphic choices, punctuations are material and visual elements that contribute to several significations of the 'same' work" (Chartier, 2022, pp. 14-15, emphasis in the original).⁷

According to Chartier, alterations to editorial forms entail different meanings in the same book, aiming at different readers. It is precisely this "variety" in the same book that is investigated here, from editorial interventions already mentioned, specially by studying subtitles or intertitles in the Gospel of Mattew editions.

Subtitles, referred to as "intertitles or internal titles" by Gerard Genette (1997, p. 294),⁸ are defined as "(...) title of a section of a book: in unitary texts, these sections may be parts, chapters, or paragraphs; in collections, they may be constituent poems, novellas, or essays" (Genette, 1997, p. 295).⁹ In biblical editions, the origin of intertitles is difficult to determine. In the specific case of printed versions, there is information that German Günther Zainer used intertitles in chapters of biblical books in 1480 (Black, 1963, p. 419). The broadest use occurred in the Geneva Bible, published in 1560. It presented intertitles to introduce the biblical chapters. After such edition, intertitles became common in biblical editions.

This paper aims at, according to Roger Chartier, "(...) indicating how typographic objects have, inscribed in their structures, spontaneous representation, by editor, of the

_

consideration, equally, the readers' notion and their actions, according to Wolfgang Iser: "Textual models designate only one aspect of the communicatory process. Hence textual repertoires and strategies simply offer a frame within which the reader must construct for himself the aesthetic object. Textual structures and structured acts of comprehension are therefore the two poles in the act of communication, whose success will depend on the degree in which the text establishes itself as a correlative in reader's consciousness" (...), and the text is complete when its meaning is constituted by the reader (Iser, 1987, p. 5, emphasis added).

ISER, Wolfgang. *The Act of Reading*: A Theory of Aesthetic Response. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1987.

⁷ In Portuguese: "As modalidades de inscrição dos textos, o formato do livro, a paginação, a ilustração, as escolhas gráficas, a pontuação são elementos materiais e visuais que contribuem para as diversas significações de uma 'mesma' obra."

⁸ For reference, see footnote 5.

⁹ For reference, see footnote 5.

target audience's reading competence" (Chartier, 2001, p. 98). ¹⁰ Such aspect is dealt with by Chartier, who studied the so-called *Biblioteca Azul* [Blue Library], published in France between the sixteenth and the seventeenth centuries, with low-quality, low-price books. The editorial and the printing characteristics lead to the conclusion that, according to the author, the books were directed to a wider reading audience.

Among several editorial features identified by Chartier, I am interested in the interventions that

(...) transform the very presentation of the text, multiplying the chapters (...) and increasing the number of paragraphs. Such change is ruled by the idea that editors have about the target audience's competence and reading habits – frequently interrupted reading, which requires explicit points of reference, only feeling comfortable with brief, closed sequences (Chartier, 2002, pp. 69-70).¹¹

The quotation above has several points of contact with the editors of the biblical editions analyzed herein. The addition of more paragraphs, which presuppose choices of how to start and finish them, and, consequently, the insertion of intertitles, is easily identifiable. So is the idea that such procedure is due to the evaluation, by editors, of readers' competences or lack thereof. The "frequently interrupted reading," which propels the subdivision in paragraphs, is also shared by Bible readers. Such editorial devices have the purpose to approximate readers and text, and, therefore, to facilitate the reading process.

The relation between intertitles and reading audience is also addressed by Genette:

(...) the classical norm for intertitles in narrative fiction was divided into two strongly contrasting positions with very pronounced generic connotations: in serious fiction, parts and chapters received only numbers; in comic or popular fiction, expanded intertitles were used (1997, p. 305).¹²

¹⁰ In Portuguese: "(...) de sinalizar como os objetos tipográficos encontram inscritos em suas estruturas a representação espontânea, feita por seu editor, das competências de leitura do público ao qual ele os destina."

¹¹ In Portuguese: "(...) transformam a própria apresentação do texto, multiplicando os capítulos (...) e aumentando o número de parágrafos. Esse recorte é comandado pela ideia que têm os editores das competências e dos hábitos de leitura do público que procuram atrair – uma leitura frequentemente interrompida, que exige pontos de referência explícitos, que somente se sente à vontade com sequências breves e fechadas sobre si mesmas."

¹² For reference, see footnote 5.

The numbering of parts and chapters in the so-called "serious fiction," as well as the presence of intertitles in the "comic or popular fiction," indicate not only the absence or presence of intertitles, directed to a certain group of readers, but also, in the case mentioned by Genette, that readers of texts of "popular" nature, probably segments of the less educated society needed such paratextual resource to comprehend what was read. A similar process happens in biblical intertitles, which aim at facilitating reading.

It should be pointed out that biblical intertitles present the editors' textual interpretations. These interpretations are either shared by readers or considered by editors as likely to have a positive reception by such readers.

It is extremely relevant to remember that intertitles of biblical books are not part of the original manuscripts of the Bible. They were not written by the authors of the canonical books; they were incorporated into them by copyists and later by editors. Popular practices of Bible reading disregards such aspect, and generally attributes to intertitles the same status as that of the holy text, which renders importance to such paratextual elements.

For such reason, it is relevant to be aware that biblical texts have a long trajectory in the history of their production, transmission and editing, whether individually or conforming to the biblical canon (Lyons, 2011). Since the papyrus, and later parchments and codices, coming to TV and computer and smartphone screens, the texts have never been isolated, as they float in a supposed cloud of abstraction. On the contrary, biblical texts have always found support that bring them to life, allowing them to be received by communities and directing their readings.

The two biblical editions selected for this paper¹⁴ are part of what can be called *Família João Ferreira de Almeida* [João Ferreira de Almeida Family], which dates back to the first biblical translations done by this Portuguese man converted to the 17th century Reformation. Such translations were successively updated along the centuries (Giraldi, 2008, pp. 24-26; Malzoni, 2016, pp. 21-33).

..

¹³ LYONS, Martin. *Books*: A Living History. J. Paul Getty Museum, 2011.

¹⁴ BÍBLIA Sagrada. Traduzida por João Ferreira de Almeida. Revista e Atualizada, segunda edição, 1993, hereinafter referred to as ARA, and BÍBLIA Sagrada. Traduzida por João Ferreira de Almeida. Nova Almeida Atualizada (2017), hereinafter referred to as NAA.

The two translations of the Bible come from the *Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil* [Brazilian Biblical Society] – SBB, which was organized by evangelical Christians in 1948, with the motto *Dar a Bíblia à Pátria* [Give the Bible to the Nation] (História da SBB [History of SBB]). On the society's website, it reads: "The *Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil* is a non-profit organization, dedicated to disseminate the Bible and, therefore, promote the full development of human beings" (Sobre a SBB, 2023).

According to SBB's report, "In 2022, the *Centro de Produção de Escrituras* [Center for Production of Scriptures] published 6.3 million copies of the Scriptures," and, specifically, "this center produces, on average, a copy of the Holy Bible every three seconds" (Publicando para transformar vidas, 2023, p. 53). Such numbers make SBB one of the largest, if not the largest, publishers of bibles in the world.

Based on the assumption that editors are Gospel readers and intend to share their readings with other readers in order to facilitate the process, this paper has the objective to answer the following questions: how has the reception of the Gospel of Mattew been received by Brazilian editors and readers? How can editorial intertitles provide indications of such reception?

Such questions assume that editors manifest their perception to readers, by inserting intertitles in biblical editions. We would like to analyze such projection of readers through the intertitles in the analyzed bibles.

It is known that editorial action in texts does not necessarily imply readers' uncritical acceptance. Nevertheless, from the theoretical and practical perspective, the former has the role to found reflections on the reception acts, and the latter is subsidized by a great number of bible editions studied. Hence, we can affirm the approach is relevant.

1 Comparison of Intertitles

_

Before we start comparing intertitles, it is pertinent to identify the principles that guide their production in the two biblical editions of the Gospel of Mattew. Such

¹⁵ In Portuguese "No ano de 2022, o Centro de Produção de Escrituras publicou 6,3 milhões de exemplares das Escrituras;" "O Centro de Produção de Escrituras produz, em média, um exemplar da Bíblia Sagrada a cada três segundos."

principles are: a) using the first words of the initial verses; b) elaboration of narrative synthesis.

Let us see some examples in the chart below: 16

Using the first words of the initial verses

A genealogia de Jesus [Jesus's genealogy]

1.1-17.

¹ Livro da genealogia de Jesus Cristo, filho de Davi, filho de Abraão. ¹⁷

A tentação de Jesus [Temptation of Jesus]

4.1-11.

¹ A seguir, Jesus foi levado pelo Espírito ao deserto, para ser tentado pelo diabo. ¹⁸

A transfiguração de Jesus [Transfiguration of Jesus]

17.1-8.

¹ Seis dias depois, Jesus tomou consigo Pedro e os irmãos Tiago e João e os levou, em particular, a um alto monte. ²E Jesus foi *transfigurado* diante deles. ¹⁹

Narrative synthesis

A cura de um leproso [Cleansing a leper]

8.1 - 4.20

¹Quando Jesus desceu do monte, grandes multidões o seguiram. ²E eis que um leproso aproximou-se e o adorou, dizendo:

- Senhor, se quiser, pode me purificar.
- ³E Jesus, estendendo a mão, tocou nele, dizendo:
- Quero, sim. Fique limpo!

E, no mesmo instante, ele ficou limpo da sua lepra. ⁴Então Jesus lhe disse:

- Olhe, não conte isso a ninguém, mas vá, apresente-se ao sacerdote e faça a oferta que Moisés ordenou, para servir de testemunho ao povo.

For reference, see footnote 2.

For reference, see footnote 2.

¹⁶ Due to the fact that the selected biblical texts of both editions are very similar and have the same intertitles, we only present the transcript of the NAA edition. The analyses hereafter are based on those two Brazilian editions, as the translation aspects relate to Brazilian Portuguese.

¹⁷ {1:1}. The book of the generation of Jesus Christ, the son of David, the son of Abraham. For reference, see footnote 2.

¹⁸ 1-11. ¹Then was Jesus led of the Spirit into the wilderness, to be tempted of the devil. For reference, see footnote 2.

 $^{^{19}}$ 17.1-8. 1 And after six days Jesus taketh Peter, James, and John his brother, and bringeth them up into an high mountain apart. 2 And he was transfigured before them.

^{20 1} And when he was come down from the mountain, great multitudes followed him. ² And, behold, there came a leper and worshipped him, saying, Lord, if thou wilt, thou canst make me clean. ³ And Jesus put forth [his] hand, and touched him, saying, I will; be thou clean. And immediately his leprosy was cleansed. ⁴ And Jesus saith unto him, See thou tell no man; but go thy away, shew thyself to the priest, and offer the gift that Moses commanded, for a testimony unto them And Jesus put forth [his] hand, and touched him, saying, I will; be thou clean. And immediately his leprosy was cleansed. ⁴ And Jesus saith unto him, See thou tell no man; but go thy away, shew thyself to the priest, and offer the gift that Moses commanded, for a testimony unto them.

Jesus é senhor do sábado [Jesus is the Lord of the Sabbath] 12.1-8.21

¹ Por aquele tempo, num sábado. Jesus passou pelas searas. Estando os seus discípulos com fome, comecaram a colher espigas e a comer. ²Os fariseus, vendo isso, disseram a Jesus:

- Olhe! Os seus discípulos estão fazendo o que não é lícito fazer num sábado.
- ³Mas Jesus lhes disse:
- Vocês não leram o que Davi fez quando ele e os seus companheiros tiveram fome? ⁴Como entrou na Casa de Deus, e comeram os pães da proposição, os quais não é lícito comer, nem a ele nem aos que estavam com ele, mas exclusivamente aos sacerdotes? ⁵Ou vocês não leram na Lei que, aos sábados, os sacerdotes no templo profanam o sábado e ficam sem culpa? ⁶Pois eu lhes digo que aqui está quem é maior do que o templo. ⁷Mas, se vocês soubessem o que significa: "Quero misericórdia, e não sacrificio," não teriam condenado inocentes. ⁸Porque o Filho do Homem é senhor do sábado.

A cura de dois cegos de Jericó [Two blind men healed at Jericho] 20.29-34.22

²⁹Saindo eles de Jericó, uma grande multidão seguia Jesus. ³⁰E eis que dois cegos, sentados à beira do caminho, tendo ouvido que Jesus passava, começaram a gritar:

- Senhor, Filho de Davi, tenha compaixão de nós!
- ³¹Mas a multidão os repreendia para que se calassem. Eles, porém, gritavam cada vez mais:
- Senhor, Filho de Davi, tenha compaixão de nós!
- ³²Jesus parou, chamou-os e perguntou:
- O que vocês querem que eu lhes faça?
- ³³Eles responderam:
- Senhor, que se abram os nossos olhos.
- ³⁴Profundamente compadecido, Jesus tocou nos olhos deles. E imediatamente recuperaram a vista e o seguiram.

For the analyses, I chose two themes present in the intertitles that are approached comparatively: correction of mistaken intertitles and corrections of intertitles in the narratives. Not only do the comparative analyses aim at identifying possible mistakes in

For reference, see footnote 2.

²¹ At that time Jesus went on the sabbath day through the corn; and his disciples were an hungred, and began to pluck the ears of corn, and to eat. ² But when the Pharisees saw [it,] they said unto him, Behold, thy disciples do that which is not lawful to do upon the sabbath day. ³ But he said unto them, Have ye not read what David did, when he an hungred, and they that were with him; ⁴ How he entered into the house of God, and did eat the shewbread, which was not lawful for him to eat, neither for them which were with him, but only for the priests? 5 Or have ye not read in the law, how that on the sabbath days the priests in the temple profane the sabbath, and are blameless? ⁶But I say unto you, That in this place is [one] greater than the temple. ⁷ And if ye had known what [this] meaneth, I will have mercy, and not sacrifice, ye would not have condemned the guiltless. ⁸ For the Son of man is Lord even of the sabbath day. For reference, see footnote 2.

²² ²⁹ And as they departed from Jericho, a great multitude followed him. ³⁰ And behold, two blind men sitting by the way side, when they heard that Jesus passed by, cried out, saying, Have mercy on us, O Lord, [thou] Son of David. ³¹ And the multitude rebuked them, because they should hold their peace: but they cried the more, saying, Have mercy on us, O Lord, [thou] Son of David. 32 And Jesus stood still, and called them, and said, What will ye that shall do onto you? ³³ They say unto him, Lord, that our eyes may be opened. ³⁴ So Jesus had compassion [on them,] and touched their eyes: and immediately their eyes receive sight, and they followed him.

the ARA edition and later correction by the NAA edition, but they also aim at recognizing the criteria used by ARA when they name their intertitles.

The limitations of the choices as to the texts and topics approached is clear, as they represent a small part of a gospel which is composed by twenty-eight chapters, each one with several intertitles. Nonetheless, the exercise that follows provides elements that enable the reflection on the Gospel of Matthew, by Brazilian readers.

1.1 Correction of Mistaken Intertitles²³

Almeida Revista e Atualizada (1993) ARA	Nova Almeida Atualizada (2017) NAA
5.21-26. ²⁴	5.21-26.
Intertitle: DO HOMICÍDIO [Of the homicide].	Intertitle: Ensino a respeito da ira [Teaching about wrath].
21 Ouvistes que foi dito aos antigos: Não matarás; e: Quem matar estará sujeito a julgamento. 22 Eu, porém, vos digo que todo aquele que [sem motivo] se irar contra seu irmão estará sujeito a julgamento; e quem proferir um insulto a seu irmão estará sujeito a julgamento do tribunal; e quem lhe chamar: Tolo, estará sujeito ao inferno de fogo. 23 Se, pois, ao trazeres ao altar a tua oferta, ali te lembrares de que teu irmão tem alguma coisa contra ti, 24 deixa perante o altar a tua oferta, vai primeiro reconciliar-te com teu irmão; e, então, voltando, faze a tua oferta. 25 Entra em acordo sem demora com o teu adversário, enquanto estás com ele a caminho, para que o adversário não te entregue ao juiz, o juiz, ao oficial de justiça, e sejas recolhido à prisão. 26 Em verdade te	²¹ - Vocês ouviram o que foi dito aos antigos: "Não mate." E ainda: "Quem matar estará sujeito a julgamento." Eu, porém, lhes digo que todo aquele que se irar contra o seu irmão estará sujeito a julgamento; e quem insultar o seu irmão estará sujeito a julgamento do tribunal; e quem o chamar de tolo estará sujeito ao inferno de fogo. ²³ Portanto, se você estiver trazendo a sua oferta ao altar e lá se lembrar que o seu irmão tem alguma coisa contra você, ²⁴ deixe diante do altar a sua oferta e vá primeiro reconciliar-se com o seu irmão; e então volte e faça a sua oferta. ²⁵ - Entre em acordo sem demora com o seu adversário, enquanto você está com ele a caminho, para que o adversário não entregue você ao juiz, o juiz entregue você ao oficial de justiça, e você seja jogado na prisão. ²⁶ Em

²³ We follow the original format of the biblical versions in the transcript of intertitles and biblical texts.

For reference, see footnote 2.

²⁴ {5:21} Ye have heard that it was said by them of old time, Thou shalt not kill; and whosoever shall kill shall be in danger of the judgment: {5:22} But I say unto you, That whosoever is angry with his brother without a cause shall be in danger of the judgment: and whosoever shall say to his brother, Raca, shall be in danger of the council: but whosoever shall say, Thou fool, shall be in danger of hell fire. {5:23} Therefore if thou bring thy gift to the altar, and there rememberest that thy brother hath ought against thee; {5:24} Leave there thy gift before the altar, and go thy way; first be reconciled to thy brother, and then come and offer thy gift. {5:25} Agree with thine adversary quickly, whiles thou art in the way with him; lest at any time the adversary deliver thee to the judge, and the judge deliver thee to the officer, and thou be cast into prison. {5:26} Verily I say unto thee, Thou shalt by no means come out thence, till thou hast paid the uttermost farthing.

digo que não sairás dali, enquanto não pagares o último centavo.

5.43-48.²⁵

Intertitle: *DO AMOR AO PRÓXIMO* [Of the love for neighbors].

43 Ouvistes que foi dito: Amarás o teu próximo e odiarás o teu inimigo. 44 Eu, porém, vos digo: amai os vossos inimigos e orai pelos que vos perseguem; 45 para que vos torneis filhos do vosso Pai celeste, porque ele faz nascer o seu sol sobre maus e bons e vir chuvas sobre justos e injustos. 46 Porque, se amardes os que vos amam, que recompensa tendes? Não fazem os publicanos também o mesmo? 47 E, se saudardes somente os vossos irmãos, que fazeis de mais? Não fazem os gentios também o mesmo? 48 Portanto, sede vós perfeitos como perfeito é o vosso Pai celeste.

verdade lhe digo que você não sairá dali enquanto não pagar o último centavo.

5.43-48.

Intertitle: *O amor aos inimigos* [Love your enemies].

⁴³ - Vocês ouviram o que foi dito: "Ame o seu próximo e odeie o seu."

⁴⁴Eu, porém, lhes digo: amem os seus inimigos e orem pelos que perseguem vocês, ⁴⁵para demonstrarem que são filhos do Pai de vocês, que está nos céus. Porque ele faz o seu sol nascer sobre maus e bons e vir chuvas sobre justos e injustos. ⁴⁶Porque, se vocês amam aqueles que os amam, que recompensa terão? Os publicanos também não fazem o mesmo? ⁴⁷E, se saudarem somente os seus irmãos, o que é que estão fazendo de mais? Os gentios também não fazem o mesmo? ⁴⁸Portanto, sejam perfeitos como é perfeito o Pai de vocês, que está no céu.

Initially, let us comment on how the intertitles are spelled. In the ARA edition, the intertitles are in upper case, not in bold, differently from the others in the gospel, which present only initials in upper case and in bold. This reveals the strategy to call the readers' attention to what follows. Both selected texts are part of the so-called Sermon on the Mount (Mathew, chapters 5-7) and share such characteristic with blocks 5.27-32, 5.33-37 e 5.38-42. It is possible that the highlight is due to the context of the sermon, the most famous of those delivered by Jesus Christ. The NAA editors chose to use bold, common in all other intertitles. They add italics, present in intertitles of the Sermon on the Mount, as a way to highlight them, even though in a more discrete manner, as compared to the ARA edition. It can be concluded that the greater highlight of intertitles by the ARA editors presuppose that it is necessary for readers to carefully consider the teachings thereof.

²⁵ {5:43} Ye have heard that it hath been said, Thou shalt love thy neighbour, and hate thine enemy. {5:44} But I say unto you, Love your enemies, bless them that curse you, do good to them that hate you, and pray for them which despitefully use you, and persecute you; {5:45} That ye may be the children of your Father which is in heaven: for he maketh his sun to rise on the evil and on the good, and sendeth rain on the just and on the unjust. {5:46} For if ye love them which love you, what reward have ye? do not even the publicans the same? {5:47} And if ye salute your brethren only, what do ye more [than others?] do not even the publicans so? {5:48} Be ye therefore perfect, even as your Father which is in heaven is perfect. For reference, see footnote 2.

Let us turn to the lexicon used in the intertitles. Nowadays readers probably know the meaning of "homicídio" [homicide] (5.21-26). However, for a more accurate definition, it is necessary to look it up in the dictionary. On the other hand, NAA's choices: "Ensino a respeito da ira" [Teaching about wrath] is more didactical and, therefore, longer. Words like "ensino" [teaching] and "ira" [wrath] are perfectly understood by the average reader. In the beginning of the two ARA intertitles, the contraction of the preposition "de" [of] with the definite article "o" [the] = "do" [of the]: "Do' homicídio" [of the homicide] and "Do' amor ao próximo" [of the love for neighbors], replaces expressions like "acerca de [concerning]," "a respeito de" [with respect to], "a propósito de" [in regard to]. In this case, the purpose is the construction of shorter intertitles. The use of "do" [of the] in the beginning of titles is not common in Portuguese, as they originated in Classical Latin, and, therefore, are used in literary, philosophical texts and in essays, as well as by those who intend to resemble or use an older style. By using archaic forms, the ARA editors show a concern which is not only literary, but also stylistic.

ARA's choice of intertitles presuppose readers with a broader lexicon and with sensibility towards classic styles. On the Other hand, NAA's updatings aim at making the intertitles simpler and more didactic, which shows concern with readers' comprehension skills.

In the ARA edition, both passages emphasize the connection with the Old Testament quoted by Jesus. In 5.21-26 the focus is on the intertextual relation of v. 21 with Exodus 20.13: "Thou shalt not kill;" and 5.43-48 is associated with Leviticus 19.18: "Thou shalt not avenge, nor bear any grudge against the children of thy people, but thou shalt love thy neighbor as thyself: I [am] the LORD." Such procedure points out the connection of the texts with the Torah, the first part of the Old Testament (OT), considered the most sacred segment of the Hebrew Bible. The editors, by calling attention

-

²⁶ A literary example is in J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Silmarillion* (1977), in which a number of chapter titles begin with the preposition "of," for example Ex: 1. Do princípio dos Dias [Of the Beginning of Days]; 2. [De Aulë e Yavanna of Aulë and Yavanna]; 3. Da vinda dos Elfos e do Cativeiro de Melkor [Of the Coming of the Elves and the Captivity] etc. (TOLKIEN, J. R. R. *The Silmarillion* London: HarperCollins, 1977). T.N. The author of this article calls attention to the preposition "de" (of) and the preposition "de" (of) contracted with article "o" (the), as Portuguese language accepts this fusion.

²⁷ For reference, see footnote 2.

²⁸ For reference, see footnote 2.

²⁹ It contains the Books of Genesis, Exodus, Leviticus, Numbers and Deuteronomy.

to the relation of Jesus to the OT, were likely to have wished to clarity to readers the origin of the commandment quoted, and, at the same time, present Jesus as the one in whom the OT finds its compliance. This would be primarily a theological intention.

In turn, NAA emphasizes the updatings, by Jesus, which radicalize the commandments in the OT. By naming 5.21-26 as Ensino a respeito da ira [Teaching about wrath], the editors want to point out that, for Jesus, it is wrong to kill, as the OT states, but not only that; it is also wrong to be angry. The editors state that Jesus, by quoting the OT, assign a status of commandment to "not being angry." In the same way, by naming 5.43-48 as *O amor aos inimigos* [Love your enemies], the editors acknowledge that Jesus goes beyond the commandment established in Leviticus, and demands that his followers "love your [their] enemies" (5.44).³⁰ If the editors of ARA stress the connection of Jesus's speeches with the OT, those of NAA identify and emphasize the depth of Jesus's teachings in the expansion of the OT's demands. In this procedure, one can notice that the new intertitles have the purpose to direct readers to comprehend this radicalism which becomes effective in a proposal for life and for relationships. There is, therefore, an ethical direction.

It can be concluded that NAA's editors correct ARA's intertitles, looking for words and phrases that can be more easily understood by readers. They also stop emphasizing theological aspects – the correct comprehension of biblical texts – in order to prioritize ethical questions – the correct practice of biblical texts, which reflects a change of reading audience and their needs.

1.2 Corrections in the Narrative Intertitles³¹

Almeida Revista e Atualizada (1993) - ARA	Nova Almeida Atualizada (2017) - NAA
4.18-22. ³²	4.18-22.

³⁰ For reference, see footnote 2.

For reference, see footnote 2.

³¹ For clarification purposes, I used bold in the biblical text, in the terms that are connected with the intertitles.

³² {4:18} And Jesus, walking by the sea of Galilee, saw two brethren, Simon called Peter, and Andrew his brother, casting a net into the sea: for they were fishers. {4:19} And he saith unto them, Follow me, and I will make you fishers of men. {4:20} And they straightway left [their] nets, and followed him. {4:21} And going on from thence, he saw other two brethren, James [the son] of Zebedee, and John his brother, in a ship with Zebedee their father, mending their nets; and he called them. {4:22} And they immediately left the ship and their father, and followed him.

Intertitle: *A vocação dos discípulos* [The vocation of the disciples].

¹⁸Caminhando junto ao mar da Galileia, viu dois irmãos, Simão, chamado Pedro, e André, que lançavam as redes ao mar, porque eram pescadores. ¹⁹ E disse-lhes: Vinde após mim, e eu vos farei pescadores de homens. ²⁰ Então, eles deixaram imediatamente as redes e o seguiram. ²¹ Passando adiante, viu outros dois irmãos, Tiago, filho de Zebedeu, e João, seu irmão, que estavam no barco em companhia de seu pai, consertando as redes; e chamouos. ²² Então, eles, no mesmo instante, deixando o barco e seu pai, o seguiram.

9.23-26.33

Intertitle: *A ressurreição da filha de Jairo* [The resurrection of Jairus's daughter].

²³Tendo Jesus chegado à casa do **chefe** e vendo os tocadores de flauta e o povo em alvoroço, disse: ²⁴ Retirai-vos, porque não está morta a menina, mas dorme. E riam-se dele. ²⁵ Mas, afastado o povo, entrou Jesus, tomou a menina pela mão, e ela se levantou. ²⁶ E a fama deste acontecimento correu por toda aquela terra.

Intertitle: *Jesus chama quatro pescadores* [Jesus calls four fishermen].

¹⁸Caminhando junto ao mar da Galileia, Jesus viu dois irmãos, Simão, chamado Pedro, e André. **Eles lançavam as redes ao mar, porque eram pescadores**. ¹⁹ Jesus lhes disse:

— Venham comigo, e eu os farei pescadores de gente.

²⁰Então eles deixaram imediatamente as redes e o seguiram.

²¹Pouco mais adiante, Jesus viu outros dois irmãos, Tiago, filho de Zebedeu, e João, o irmão dele. Eles estavam no barco em companhia de seu pai, **consertando as redes**; e Jesus os chamou. ²² Então eles, no mesmo instante, deixaram o barco e seu pai e seguiram Jesus.

9.18-26.

Intertitle: *Jesus cura uma mulher e uma menina* [Jesus cures a woman and a girl].

¹⁸Enquanto Jesus lhes dizia estas coisas, eis que um **chefe da sinagoga**, aproximando-se, o adorou e disse:

— Minha filha morreu agora mesmo; mas venha impor a mão sobre ela, e ela viverá.

¹⁹E Jesus se levantou e o seguiu, juntamente com os seus discípulos.

²⁰E eis que **uma mulher**, que durante doze anos vinha sofrendo de uma hemorragia, veio por trás de Jesus e tocou na borda da capa dele. ²¹ Porque dizia consigo mesma: "Se eu apenas tocar na capa dele, ficarei curada." ²² Então Jesus, voltando-se e vendo-a, disse:

- Coragem, filha, a sua fé salvou você. E, desde aquele instante, a mulher ficou sã. ²³ Tendo Jesus chegado à casa do chefe e vendo os tocadores de flauta e o povo em alvoroço, disse:

²⁴— Saiam daqui! Porque **a menina** não está morta, mas dorme.

E riam-se dele. ²⁵ Mas, quando o povo tinha sido colocado para fora, Jesus entrou, tomou

³³ {9:23} And when Jesus came into the ruler's house, and saw the minstrels and the people making a noise, {9:24} He said unto them, Give place: for the maid is not dead, but sleepeth. And they laughed him to scorn. {9:25} But when the people were put forth, he went in, and took her by the hand, and the maid arose. {9:26} And the fame hereof went abroad into all that land. For reference, see footnote 2.

a **menina** pela mão, e ela se levantou.²⁶ E a notícia deste acontecimento se espalhou por toda aquela terra.

As for the graphic presentation, the intertitles are the same, with initials in upper case and in bold, which indicates that NAA followed its predecessor in such feature. The lexicon used in both versions does not entail, from the perspective of its understanding, difficulties, as there are terms of general knowledge. Even words that may be considered religious, such as "vocação" [vocation], "discípulos" [disciples] e "ressurreição" [ressurection] are not technical – they are widely known.

Each edition offers a different perspective in relation to the texts. On one hand, ARA focuses on the four men when it states that the vocation belongs to the "discípulos" [disciples], proposing, hence, that they are the central point of the passage. This choice is reinforced by the absence of the name Jasus in the intertitle. On the Other hand, NAA places "Jesus" as the subject of the verb "chamar" [call] and, therefore, assigns him the role of protagonist, by relating the reading of the texts to his actions.

These options may generate different reactions by readers. ARA conducts reflections towards a commitment to being Jesus's disciples, whereas NAA invites readers to think of the one who calls the disciples. In the analyses of the narratives, it can be said that the second one is more relevant, as in the previous texts we came across Jesus's preparation by being led into the desert to be tempted (4.1-11) and the beginning of his activities in Galilee, by preaching the kingdom of heaven (4.12-17). Next, we find the analyzed text, with the narrator reporting an example of Jesus's actions.

Still from the narrative perspective, it is relevant to point out that ARA, in intertitle $4.18-22 - a \ vocação \ dos \ discípulos$ [the vocation of the disciples], – anticipates information that will appear only in 5.1, when Jesus calls his followers "disciples": "And seeing the multitudes, he went up into a mountain: and when he was set, his disciples came unto him." This text does not specify who the disciples are. Surely the four fishermen are among them, but the audience was probably bigger. Actually, the Gospel of Mattew will not present a list of the disciples' names until 10.1-4, calling them, equally, "apostles" (10.2). In the selected text, even though the act of "following" Jesus by the four men may be understood as a gesture of their connection with him, which would

-

³⁴ For reference, see footnote 2.

configure discipleship, the use of "disciples" in the intertitle should have only been used when it appeared in the narrative. We can consider such intertitle as an oversight of the editors concerning the narrative aspect of the gospel. However, there is more than this. The choice to include "disciples" demonstrates concern with providing readers with the most information possible, perhaps presuming difficulty of text comprehension and of its relation with the narrative sequence.

NAA corrects such mistake by replacing "discípulos" [disciples] with "quatro pescadores" [four fishermen], which indicates their professional activity, as the text affirms (v. 18), with the detail that two of them "consertavam as redes" [mending their nets]³⁵ (v. 21). By excluding the term "disciples" and replacing it with the activity, NAA proceeds correctly narrative-wise and it also points to readers the core of the narrative: Jesus's statement that, from fishermen of fish, he will make them "fishers of men" (v. 19).³⁶

In 9.23-26, ARA's intertitle shows information that is not in the Gospel of Mattew: the name of the father of the girl who was resuscitated by Jesus – Jairus. In fact, the name appears in the Gospels of Mark $(5.22)^{37}$ and of Luke $(8.41)^{.38}$ Once more the editors sacrifice the narrative by bringing information which is external to the gospel, certainly feeling the need to make the text clearer to readers.

NAA correctly excludes the father's name and expands the block – it initiates in verse 18 instead of 23 (ARA) – when it adds the cure of a woman who is situated in the narrative, on the occasion of the girl's resurrection. Such narrative segment is configured as a chiasmus,³⁹ as:

A. v. 18-19. Pai da menina [The girl's father].

B. v. 20-22. *Mulher* [woman].

A. v. 23-26. *Jairo e a filha* [Jairus and daughter].

³⁶ For reference, see footnote 2.

Bakhtiniana, São Paulo, 19 (1): e63484e, Jan./March 2024

All content of Bakhtiniana. Revista de Estudos do Discurso is licensed under a Creative Commons attribution-type CC-BY 4.0

³⁵ For reference, see footnote 2.

³⁷ "And, behold, there cometh one of the rulers of the synagogue, Jairus by name; and when he saw him, he fell at his feet."

For reference, see footnote 2.

³⁸ "And, behold, there came a man named Jairus, and he was a ruler of the synagogue: and he fell down at Jesus' feet, and besought him that he would come into his house." For reference, see footnote 2.

³⁹ "A kind of antithesis, chiasmus refers to the crossing of parallel synthetic groups, so that a word of the first one is repeated in the second one, in reverse order." In Portuguese: "Espécie de antítese, o quiasmo consiste no cruzamento de grupos sintáticos paralelos, de forma que um vocábulo do primeiro se repete no segundo, em posição inversa (A B x B A)" (Moisés, 2010, p. 426).

For such reason, the intertitle "Jesus cures a woman and a girl" is more adequate in the stream of the narrative, as it does not interrupt a text which stylistically should be read as a whole. With these organizations, readers are more likely to perceive, not only the narrative unity but also the drama involved in the woman's healing and the girl's resurrection.

Nevertheless, if the NAA's intertitle is correct, it also makes a mistake when it proposes that Jesus "cures (...) the girl." Actually, Jesus resurrects her. There is, therefore, misinformation that affects readers.

We can say that NAA corrects ARA's mistaken intertitles and tries to preserve the emphasis and the narrative unity of the texts, by presenting more extensive segments (9.18-26). It is also possible to conclude that NAA's editors intervene less in the intertitles from the interpretative point of view, whereas ARA's editors present external information, aiming at making the intertitles a kind of text interpretation instead of its summary.

There is another paratextual source with reader-related data, which expands the analyzes of intertitles. Such source is found in the pre-textual elements of the two editions studied herein. These elements constitute concrete subsidies that editors themselves provide to the research. ARA has only one piece of information regarding the intertitles: "The titles that subdivide the biblical text, summarizing, in themes, the content of one chapter or more, whole chapters or even more, are not part of the original text. They were added later (Gn 1.1; 2.4)" (Explicação de formas gráficas especiais, títulos, referências e notas, 1999, p. vii). Despite being brief, the text is relevant, as it indicates that the intertitles summarize, "in themes, the content." As we have mentioned, ARA's editors do more than that.

In the Apresentação (2017), NAA's editors reveal some procedures to enhance the translation, which may point to alterations to the intertitles. For instance, they maintain the principle of previous editions: "present a classic text in a current language" (Apresentação, 2017, p. V). Next, they add: "(...) as the goal is to offer a text of easy comprehension, the famous norm was adopted: 'formal or literal whenever possible;

_

⁴⁰ In Portuguese: "Os títulos que subdividem o texto bíblico, resumindo em temas o conteúdo de um ou mais parágrafos ou de capítulos inteiros ou até mais, não fazem parte do texto original. Eles foram acrescentados posteriormente (Gn 1.1; 2.4)."

⁴¹ In Portuguese: "apresentar um texto clássico numa linguagem atual."

dynamic whenever necessary" (Apresentação, 2017, p. V).⁴² The question that guided the translation committee was: "Will readers be able to understand the text without having to resort to the dictionary?" (Apresentação, 2017, p. V).⁴³

In item *Peculiaridades da Nova Almeida Atualizada* [Peculiarities of Nova Almeida Atualizada Updated], some topics are of interest: "3. In case of archaic words, which are unlikely to be understood without looking up in the dictionary, easier synonyms were used" (Apresentação, 2017, p. VI). 44 "4. The pronouns 'tu' and 'vós' were replaced by 'você' and 'vocês,' 45 as nowadays in Brazil, the form of treatment 'vós' is seldom used to address an audience" (Apresentação, 2017, p. VI). 46 "11. By revising the long sentences, we aimed at, to the greatest extent possible, making them shorter. Then, many semi colons (;) were replaced by periods" (Apresentação, 2017, p. VI). 47 Assim, muitos pontos e vírgulas (;) foram substituídos por pontos" (Apresentação, 2017, p. VI). The following item is especially important." Whenever possible, titles of sections were updated, and formulations from the biblical text itself were preferred" (Apresentação, 2017, p. VII).

Based on the information above, it can be affirmed that NAA presents more sensibility towards readers, and awareness of their context and limitations. This becomes clear in the option for: a "current language," "offer a text of easy comprehension," "without looking up in the dictionary," use of "easier synonyms," making long sentences "shorter," and updating of "titles of sections" from "the biblical text itself."

Such information was generally applied to the intertitles, as we could notice. By connecting the intertitle internal analysis with the data in the editorial pre-textual elements, we see an evident concern with readers' comprehension, which allows for

mente serão entendidas sem consulta ao dicionário, procurou-se usar sinônimos mais fáceis."

⁴² In Portuguese: "[...] como o objetivo é oferecer um texto de fácil compreensão, foi adotada a conhecida norma: 'formal ou literal sempre que possível; dinâmico sempre que necessário.'"

⁴³ In Portuguese: "O leitor será capaz de entender o texto sem ter de recorrer ao dicionário?"

⁴⁴ In Portuguese: 3. No caso de palavras arcaicas, que difícil

⁴⁵ T.N. In the Portuguese language, "tu" and "vós" are subject pronouns, second person singular and second person plural, respectively. They mean "you." "Você" and "vocês" are third person singular and third person plural, respectively, meaning "you."

⁴⁶ In Portuguese: "Os pronomes 'tu' e 'vós' deram lugar a 'você' e 'vocês,' visto que hoje, no Brasil, dificilmente alguém se dirige a um público usando a forma de tratamento 'vós.'"

⁴⁷ In Portuguese: "11. Revisando os períodos longos, procurou-se, na medida do possível, transformá-los em frases mais curtas. Assim, muitos pontos e vírgulas (;) foram substituídos por pontos."

⁴⁸ In Portuguese: "16. Sempre que possível, os títulos de seção foram atualizados, dando-se preferência a formulações derivadas do próprio texto bíblico."

awareness of the limitations in apprehending not only biblical language but also its content.

Final Considerations

In the conclusion of this paper, I resume Chartier's statements quoted earlier. The author points out that editors' actions are centered on readers' level of competence. The more limited the reading audience, the bigger the editorial actions that aim at approximating readers and text. This is true at all times, for all works, but it is especially true for texts with greater historical distance from readers, like the Bible.

If the text is not changeable, paratextual elements will approximate it to readers. In the case of the Bible, it is important to remember that titles of books, numbers and tiles of chapters, numbers of verses and intertitles, are editorial interventions that appear in the course of history in order to facilitate reading.

From a series of existing paratexts, this paper chose to analyze the intertitles present in the Gospel of Matthew, in the ARA and in the NAA editions. I intended to identify how editors read such texts and, from their readings, understand how they perceived readers. The following step was to call attention the updatings NAA conducted in ARA's intertitles, as well as the implications for investigating Brazilian Gospel readers.

The strategies of both biblical versions differ, as far as readers are concerned. ARA tries to orient them by providing, whenever possible, clarifying information, even to the detriment of literary aspects of the texts. Accordingly, such edition reveals readers who need information, in order to comprehend the biblical texts. Nevertheless, the use of archaic words and expressions tend to hinder the comprehension of intertitles, as well as of texts summarized in them. NAA develops an equal concern with clarity in intertitles, but it conforms to a more accessible language and to organizations of textual blocks that facilitate the understanding of content. It aims at being sensitive in the creation of intertitles concerning the lexicon used in the biblical texts. Most of the time, it is successful. From the strategies, a kind of reader arises. Despite the limitations in lexicon and equal limitations in understanding biblical texts, this reader receives help, by means of the intertitles. Such help refers to meaning of texts and their narrative aspects.

The analyzes developed herein surely work as a case study which needs further expansion. However, they make clear that biblical editions present stable texts in the course of millennia, and they also are configured with the creation of intertitles, which aim at meeting the needs of changes in reading audiences.

REFERENCES

APRESENTAÇÃO. *A BÍBLIA Sagrada*. Traduzida em português por João Ferreira de Almeida. Nova Almeida Atualizada. Barueri, SP: Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil, 2017. p. IV-VII.

BÍBLIA Sagrada. Traduzida por João Ferreira de Almeida. Nova Almeida Atualizada. Barueri, SP: Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil, 2017.

BÍBLIA Sagrada. 2. ed. Traduzida por João Ferreira de Almeida. Revista e Atualizada. Barueri, SP: Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil, 1993.

BLACK, M. H. XII. The Printed Bible. *In:* GREENSLADE, S. L. (org.). *The Cambridge History of the Bible:* The West from the Reformation to the Present Day. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1963. pp. 408-475.

BOXALL, Ian. *Discovering Matthew:* Context, Interpretation, Reception. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2014.

BOXALL, Ian. *Matthew Through the Centuries*. Hoboken: Wiley, 2018 (Serie: Wiley Blackwell Bible Commentaries).

CHARTIER, Roger. Do livro à leitura. *In:* CHARTIER, Roger (org.). *Práticas da leitura*. Tradução de Cristiane Nascimento. São Paulo: Estação Liberdade, 2001. p. 77-105.

CHARTIER, Roger. *Editar e traduzir:* mobilidade e materialidade dos textos (séculos XVI-XVIII). Tradução de Mariana Echalar. São Paulo: Editora Unesp, 2022.

CHARTIER, Roger. *Os desafios da escrita*. Tradução de Fulvia M. L. Moretto. São Paulo: Editora UNESP, 2002.

DARNTON, Robert. *O beijo de Lamourette:* mídia, cultura e revolução. Tradução de Denise Bottmann. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2010.

EXPLICAÇÃO de formas gráficas especiais, títulos, referências e notas. *A BÍBLIA Sagrada*. Traduzida em português por João Ferreira de Almeida. Revista e Atualizada no Brasil. 2 ed. Barueri, SP: Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil, 1999.

FEBVRE, Lucien; MARTIN, Henri-Jean. *O aparecimento do livro*. Tradução de Fulvia M. L. Moreto e Guacira Marcondes Machado. São Paulo: Edusp, 2017.

GENETTE, Gérard. *Paratextos editoriais*. Tradução de Álvaro Faleiros. Cotia, SP: Ateliê Editorial, 2009.

HISTÓRIA da SBB. Disponível em: https://biblia.sbb.org.br/sobre-a-sbb/historia-da-sbb. Acesso em 09 de julho, 2023.

GIRALDI, Luiz Antonio. *História da Bíblia no Brasil*. Barueri, SP: Sociedade Bíblica do Brasil, 2008.

ISER, Wolfgang. *O ato de leitura:* uma teoria do efeito estético. v. 2. Tradução de Johannes Kretschmer. São Paulo: Ed. 34, 1999.

LEONEL, João. Mateus, o evangelho. São Paulo: Paulus, 2013.

LYONS, Martyn. *Livro*. Uma história viva. Tradução de Luís Carlos Borges. São Paulo: Editora Senac. 2011.

MALZONI, Cláudio Vianney. As edições da Bíblia no Brasil. São Paulo: Paulinas, 2016.

MATZ, Brian. A. Greek and Latin Patristics and Orthodox Churches. Matthew, Gospel of. FUREY, Constance M. et. al. (ed.). Encyclopedia of the Bible and Its Reception. v. 18. Berlin/Boston: Walter de Gruyter, 2020. Colunas 129-131.

MCKENZIE, D. F. *Bibliografia e a sociologia dos textos*. Tradução de Fernanda Veríssimo. São Paulo: Edusp, 2018.

MOISÉS, Massaud. Dicionário de termos literários. 19. ed. São Paulo: Cultrix, 2010.

NOVAKOVIC, Lidija *et al.* Matthew, Gospel of. *In:* FUREY Constance M. *et al* (ed.). *Encyclopedia of the Bible and its Reception*. Berlin/Boston: Walter de Gruyte, v. 18, 2020, colunas 123-164.

PUBLICANDO para transformar vidas. ABNB. A Bíblia no Brasil. n. 268, p. 52-53, 2023.

SOBRE a SBB. Disponível em: https://www.sbb.org.br/historia-da-sbb/quem-somos. Acesso em 04 de setembro, 2023.

TOLKIEN, J. R. R. O Silmarillion. Editado por Christopher Tolkien. Tradução de Reinaldo José Lopes. Rio de Janeiro: HarperCollins, 2019.

Translated by Raquel D Elboux Couto Nunes - rdelbouxnunes@gmail.com

Received September 05, 2023 Accepted November 04, 2023

Research Data and Other Materials Availability

The contents underlying the research text are included in the manuscript.

Reviews

Due to the commitment assumed by *Bakhtiniana*. *Revista de Estudos do Discurso* [*Bakhtiniana*. Journal of Discourse Studies] to Open Science, this journal only publishes reviews that have been authorized by all involved.

Review II

The article approaches an aspect which is very present in society, especially in the context of reading biblical texts, as it shows how the intertitles inserted/incorporated in the versions of the texts manifest editors' interpretations. Presuming that the gospel of Mattew is widely read and that the intertitles orient its reading, the paper presents an adequate proposal, in relation to the theme. It explains the main objective and it is coherent in developing and demonstrating results. The theoretical framework is appropriate for the comprehension of central notions. The article is significantly original, as it shows the role of intertitles for understanding biblical texts. It also points out how intertitles are editorial interventions that appear in the course of history, influencing the reception of the texts. With the necessary adjustments, I appreciate the discussion presented in "The Gospel of Matthew and The History of Reading in Brazilian Bible Editions" and I am in favor of its publication. However, the author needs to make some changes, regarding clarity, language adequacy and accuracy. I list the necessary changes as follows:

- I. I suggest further development of the notions "reader configuration" and "reader profile," which appear on page 3 and are relevant for the study. It would be pertinent to articulate theoretical references to substantiate such notions. Although the texts by Bakhtin and the Circle are not the theoretical foundation used, I point out that such texts have strong discussions on reader/addressee. I might be pertinent to develop a reflection on the conception of reader in the intertitles in the gospel of Matthew. According to the Bakhtinian theory, the reader is not a passive subject, but an active, present, responsive one, in the creation of text/utterance.
- II. On page 7, I suggest adjusting the first question, "how has the gospel of Mattew been received by Brazilian editors and readers?" Such question implies, at the first moment, that the analysis will focus on the reception of the gospel of Mattew by two groups "editors" and "readers." However, the discussions only focus on "editors," who are adequately presented also as "readers." But this comprehension can only be achieved in the analyses.
- III. Still on page 7, the text reads "We would like to analyze such projection of readers through the intertitles in the analyzed bibles." Wouldn't it be the case to explicit that as research purpose and object? In other words, in the introduction, such idea is not presented as purpose nor object of the research, but this is done in the analyses.
- IV. Revise the following statement, on page 2: "The Gospel of Matthew has a rich reception history, the most read and appreciated by Christians of all times." Such statement needs foundation, as the text does not develop deeply the history of this reception and does not show data to corroborate the statement that Mattew is the most widely read and appreciated text.
- V. Correction of the use of comma (page 3): Therefore, this paper proposes a comparative analysis of the subtitles in two editions of the Gospel of Matthew, in order to minimally fill this gap." In the same part, I suggest revising the use of "history of Reading," as the word "history" implies there will be a study contemplating the reception of the text in the course of a certain time. The focus of the article is not to trace such history, considering temporalities. For example, intertitles of the same text in different times are not analyzed. The fact that is a comparative analysis is not enough to deem it as a "history of reading." VI. I recommend an explanation note about the notion of "paratext" present on page 3.

VII. Correct (page 3): "it will be compared with the previous [version]." [spelling corrected]

VIII. I recommend using, in the charts of pages 10 and 11, the term "intertitle," adopted in the article, instead of "title."

IX. I recommend revising the statement made in the last paragraph of the final considerations, especially the idea that "biblical editions present unchangeable texts in the course of millennia." This discussion is not present in the article and there was no argument to corroborate such conclusion. For example, in what sense would the text be "unchangeable?" The author may rephrase the idea, without prejudice to the conclusions duly corroborated in the discussion. ACCEPTED

Ilderlândio Assis de Andrade Nascimento - Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Norte, Caicó, Rio Grande do Norte, Brazil; https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3654-614X; ilderlandionascimento@yahoo.com.br

Reviewed on September 21, 2023.

Review III.

In my opinion, the article is excellent and I am sure it will contribute significantly to a critical reading of the Gospel of Matthew. However, there are corrections to be made, as follows: p. 3 verão – versão [spelling]. Only the indispensable and explanatory footnotes should be kept. Information on footnotes with bibliographical references must be incorporated in the text. ACCEPTED

Francisco Benedito Leite – Pontifícia Universidade Católica de Campinas, Campinas, São Paulo, Brazil; https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7295-6285; ethnosfran@hotmail.com

Reviewed on October 29, 2023.