

Managerialism in the Continuing Education of Teachers in Brazil: An Analysis of Documents Proposed by the National Council of Education Secretaries

Gerencialismo na formação continuada de professores no Brasil: uma análise de documentos propostos pelo Conselho Nacional de Secretários de Educação

Vanderlei José Valim Vieira Filho*
Fábio Peres Gonçalves*

ABSTRACT

The influence of the National Council of Education Secretaries (CONSED) is recognized in the processes of implementing public policies for continuing teacher education in Brazil, as well as its role in the articulation of operational logistics and its approximation with third-sector institutions, which tends to influence the guidelines for training processes. Given the above, this work asks the following research question: what are the characteristics proposed for the continuing education of teachers in the context of implementing the National Common Core Curriculum Base (BNCC) and the New High School (NEM)? For this purpose, we analyse documents made available on the site of CONSED, organized by the Working Group (GT) Continuing Education. To that end, we used the Discursive Textual Analysis (DTA) proposed by Moraes (2003). As a result, categories associated with guidelines for continuing teacher education processes emerged: alignment with US educational policies; governance; and assessments, control, and monitoring. These categories highlight aspects such as: the need to rethink a discourse of “efficacy” of continuing teacher education conducted in the US; the governance as a principle that involves institutions of the so-called third sector aligned with the managerial proposal of public administration; assessment as an instrument for monitoring and controlling what is taught in schools. We concluded that managerial principles are strongly present in the analyzed

Translated by: Maria Isabel de Castro Lima. E-mail: baulima@gmail.com

* Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, UFSC, Florianópolis, Santa Catarina, Brasil, E-mail: qosavalimvieira@gmail.com - <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2645-7749>; E-mail: fabiopgon@hotmail.com - <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0172-2411>

documents and, therefore, as a characteristic of the continuing teacher education processes for implementing the BNCC and the NEM.

Keywords: Third sector. Common National Curriculum Base. New High School.

RESUMO

É reconhecida a influência do Conselho Nacional de Secretários da Educação (CONSED) nos processos de implementação de políticas públicas de formação continuada docente no Brasil, bem como o seu papel na articulação da logística operacional e a sua aproximação com instituições do terceiro setor, o que tende a influenciar nas orientações para os processos formativos. Diante do exposto, o presente trabalho tem como questão de pesquisa a ser respondida: quais as características propostas à formação continuada de professores no contexto de implementação da Base Nacional Comum Curricular (BNCC) e do Novo Ensino Médio (NEM)? Para tanto, foram analisados documentos disponibilizados no *site* do CONSED, organizados pelo Grupo de Trabalho (GT) Formação Continuada. No exame dos documentos foi utilizada a Análise Textual Discursiva (ATD), proposta por Moraes (2003). Como resultado desta análise, emergiram categorias associadas às orientações para os processos de formação continuada de professores: alinhamento com políticas educacionais estadunidenses; governança; e avaliações, controle e monitoramento. Nessas categorias se ressaltam aspectos como: a necessidade de repensar um discurso da “eficácia” de formações continuadas de docentes realizadas nos EUA; a governança na qualidade de um princípio que envolve instituições do chamado terceiro setor alinhadas com a proposta gerencial de administração pública; a avaliação como um instrumento de monitoramento e controle a respeito do que se ensina nas escolas. Conclui-se que princípios gerencialistas se fazem fortemente presentes nos documentos analisados e, portanto, como uma característica aos processos de formação continuada de docentes para implementação da BNCC e do NEM.

Palavras chaves: Terceiro setor. Base Nacional Comum Curricular. Novo Ensino Médio.

Introduction

It was in the context of political instability and the deepening of the neoliberal nature of public policies that the third –and final– version of the National Common Core Curriculum Base (BNCC) and the High School Reform (REM) were developed.

It is known that educational policies are influenced by so-called business reformers. Those groups have contributed to developing managerial policies, establishing competencies, and reinforcing a culture of performativity that has been minimizing the role of the State in educational policies and that have collaborated to strengthen teachers’ accountability (OSTERMANN; REZENDE, 2021). Ostermann and Rezende (2021) understand that, specifically, the business reformers play the central role in the REM and the BNCC, opposing the proposals of the education professionals –educators and researchers– and investing efforts in managerial educational policies.

According to Hood (1991), the political practices of the *New Public Management*,

also called, according to Costa (2010), the managerial model of public administration, are expressed through mechanisms such as:

Professional management in the public sector; establishment of explicit standards and performance measures; greater emphasis on controlling outcomes; disaggregation of the public sector into smaller units; increased competition in the public sector; adoption of private sector management practices in the public sector; emphasis on greater discipline and restraint in the use of resources in the public sector for greater efficiency (HOOD, 1991, p. 4-5, our translation).

It is important to emphasize that, in Brazil, the managerial administration model is the founding element of the Master Plan for the Reform of the State Apparatus (PDRAE), of 1995 (BRASIL, 1995), mentored by Minister Luiz Carlos Bresser-Pereira, the former occupant of the Ministry of Finance, later responsible for the Ministry of Federal Administration and State Reform (MARE).

Gomes and Lima (2019) state that the State Reform Plan re-signified the role played by the State in public management, which, according to the Plan's guidelines, should increasingly play the role of the reviewer of the social policies, including education, being decreasingly responsible for promoting those policies.

For the PDRAE, the Brazilian owed to the crisis of the State and its way of managing social policies. In this sense, the managerial model, together with the decentralization processes, would contribute to overcoming the crisis, leaving behind the outdated bureaucratic public administration model. Thus, one of the strategies for implementing the management model, contained in the PDRAE, was publicity, that is, "[...] change in the ownership regime of the executing entities of specific public services, which would cease to be state public to be non-state public" (COSTA, 2010, p. 185). In this way, the PDRAE signaled the insertion and strengthening of a "new" sector to take care of social policies, the non-state public (LIMA, 2004), also known as the third sector.

Without intending to exhaust the subject, it cannot be disregarded that the PDRAE was prepared under the prescription of multilateral organizations, of which the World Bank (WB) stands out. Regarding this debate, Carneiro's (2019) study highlights the important and decisive role that the WB played in consolidating managerialism in Brazil in the 1990s, which has its guidelines in the PDRAE.

According to Bresser-Pereira (2006, p. 30), "the managerial approach to public administration emerged strongly in Great Britain and the United States of America (USA) after conservative governments took power in 1979 (Thatcher's government) and 1980 (Reagan's administration)". With the crisis of the welfare state, several countries such as Great Britain, the USA and, later, New Zealand and Australia had public administration initiatives that configured State reform processes. Gradually, such initiatives were included in the recipes of international organizations and agendas of other countries, becoming part of what is conventionally called the Washington

Consensus (COSTA, 2010).

Although managerialism has emerged in typically neoliberal governments such as those of Margareth Thatcher and Ronald Reagan, its debate goes beyond them, having as a central element the debate on the administrative reforms in Western Europe, Eastern Europe, and third world countries. However, it is essential to consider the strength of the public administration managerialist perspective in several neoliberal countries during the 1970s and 1980s (ABRUCIO, 1997).

Several studies, such as those by Ostermann and Rezende (2021), Santos, Borges, and Lopes (2019), Deconto and Ostermann (2021), and Rodrigues, Pereira, and Mohr (2021), understand the importance of investigating the consequences of the BNCC and the New High School (NEM) for teacher education. For example, Rodrigues, Pereira, and Mohr (2021) understand that the current official proposals for teacher education in Brazil, besides being influenced by official curricular guidelines for Basic Education, are aligned with the interest of business reformers in silencing researchers' studies on teacher education that could collaborate in constructing educational policies. Beyond the official documents, one must also consider the importance of investigating other documents that can influence the direction of teacher education in the current scenario of implementation of the BNCC and the NEM.

Unlike the studies that contribute greatly to the understanding of the implementation of current educational public policies in Brazil and the teacher education linked to them, we understand that the investigation developed here has as its basic structure the emphasis on the characteristics of managerialism as a public management model and as a guide for the development processes of contemporary educational public policies. There is an urgent need to understand how principles of managerialism can be expressed not only in the functioning of institutions but also among Basic Education teachers and in the formative processes to which they are submitted, especially those related to the implementation of the BNCC and the NEM.

Given the above, we investigated, in documents from the National Council of Education Secretaries (CONSED), organized by the Working Group (GT) Continuing Education, characteristics proposed for continuing teacher education in the context of implementing the BNCC and the NEM:

he CONSED WG Continuing Education was composed of representatives of the 27 State Education Departments (26 states and the Federal District) responsible for continuing education actions in their networks, indicated by their respective secretaries, and by five representatives of the National Union of Municipal Education Leaders (UNDIME), with one representative per region of the country (CONSED, 2017, p. 17).

This investigation constitutes a broader study that aims to analyze the deepening of managerialism in the processes of continuing education of Basic Education teachers.

Methodological paths for analysis of documents proposed by CONSED

As already highlighted, we analyzed documents organized by the WG Continuing Education, available on the site¹ of the CONSED, as presented in Chart 1.

CHART 1: Documents on the site of CONSED.

Documents
D-01)Grupo de Trabalho Formação Continuada de Professores: Documento de Considerações para Orientar o Aperfeiçoamento das Políticas de Formação Continuada de Professores à Luz da Implementação da Base Nacional Comum Curricular (BNCC) (Date: August 2017) [Continuing Teacher Education Working Group: Document of Considerations to Guide the Improvement of Continuing Teacher Education Policies in the Light of the Implementation of the National Common Core Curriculum Base (BNCC)]
D-02)Formação Continuada de Professores: Contribuições da Literatura Baseada em Evidências (Date: June 2017) [Continuing Teacher Education: Contributions of Evidence-Based Literature]
D-03)GT CONSED Formação Continuada de Professores - Relatório Inspiracional [CONSED Continuing Teacher Education WG - Inspirational Report]
D-04)GT de Formação Continuada do CONSED: Boas práticas para o uso efetivo do 1/3 da hora atividade(Date: 5 July 2018)[CONSED Continuing Education WG: Good practices for the effective use of 1/3 of the hour/activity]
D-05)Grupo de Trabalho Formação Continuada de Professores da Educação Básica: Diretrizes Orientadoras para tornar o uso do 1/3 de hora-atividade para formação continuada mais efetivo (Date: December 2018)[Working Group on Continuing Education of Basic Education Teachers: Guidelines to make the use of the 1/3 hour-activity for more effective continuing education]
D-06)Guia de implementação da Base Nacional Comum Curricular: Orientações para o processo de implementação da BNCC (Date: 2018) [Implementation guide for the National Common Core Curriculum: Guidelines for the BNCC implementation process]
D-07)Grupo de Trabalho Formação Continuada de Professores da Educação Básica: Diretrizes Orientadoras para tornar o uso de 1/3 de hora-atividade para formação continuada mais efetivo (Dat: December 2018) [Working Group on Continuing Education of Basic Education Teachers: Guiding Guidelines to make the use of 1/3 of an hour-activity for more effective continuing education]
D-08)Boas Práticas para uso efetivo do 1/3 da hora-atividade(Date: January 2019) [Best Practices for effective use of the 1/3 of the hour-activity]

¹Available at: <https://consed.org.br/downloads>

D-09)FT Base Nacional da profissão docente (Date: July to November 2019) [FT National Base of the Teaching Profession]
D-10)Referenciais Profissionais Docentes para Formação Continuada (Date not given) [Teaching Professional Benchmarks for Continuing Education]
D-11)Exemplo do detalhamento de um referencial da Califórnia em níveis de desenvolvimento, extraído do Continuum da prática docente [Example of a breakdown of a California benchmark in levels of development, taken from the Continuum of Teaching Practice - 2012) – translated version) (Date not given)
D-12)Referenciais da Califórnia para a profissão docente [California Standards for the Teaching Profession - CSTP - 2009) – translated version] (Date not given)
D-13)Matriz de autoavaliação do professor – Fundamental I (Date not given)[Teacher self-assessment matrix – Elementary School first Years]

SOURCE: Prepared by the authors based on the documents available on *site* of CONSED.

The documents were analyzed based on the Discursive Textual Analysis (DTA), proposed by Moraes (2003). The DTA consists of three stages: unitization, categorization, and communication. In the first stage, the documents were fragmented into units of meaning extracted according to the research objective. Then, those units of meaning were grouped according to semantic criteria into emerging categories. Those categories, despite not originating from a previously conceived theoretical framework such as the *a priori* categories, are not engendered in a theoretical vacuum. Otherwise, the supposed interpretive neutrality of the reading of the corpus would be valued. The references that guided the examination of the documents are addressed in the analysis, in dialogue with the empirical information. They are theoretical contributions that discuss managerialism that helped in the categorization process and permeated the metatext, whose construction constitutes the objective of the last stage (communication) of the DTA. At this stage, descriptive and interpretative texts were prepared in each category, i.e., alignment with US educational policies, governance as a principle, and assessments, control, and monitoring. It is important to highlight that all three categories are intimately articulated with managerial principles.

Alignment with US educational policies

Part of the fragments in this category explain guidelines for teacher education processes in Brazil. Those guidelines use as a reference educational experiences carried out in different countries, and more significantly, in the USA. The following is one of the text fragments from D-10 that allude to the US National Committee for Faculty Benchmarks:

WHAT ARE PROFESSIONAL BENCHMARKS?

In case of the **National Committee for Faculty Benchmarks (USA)**, they represent core values or principles in terms of what **US teachers** must know and be able to do, regardless of subject, segment, or teaching modality.

They offer the **philosophical basis** for the development and elaboration of references with greater specification (D-10, *s. d.*, p. 7, emphasis added).

For a long time, Brazilian educational policies have been influenced by the USA. An example of this influence, according to Villani, Pacca, and Freitas (2002), is the insertion of US teaching projects in natural sciences in Brazilian Basic education. Another example of the interference of the US in directing science teachers' education in Brazil can be observed in the agreements established between Brazilian government agencies and the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), after the 1964 military coup. USAID guidelines were to direct the Brazilian government to implement content and methods in schools that would provide Brazilian students with a scientific education that considered Brazilian development according to the US interests (NASCIMENTO; FERNANDES; MENDONÇA, 2010).

Currently, the agenda of business reformers in Brazilian education reflects elements of the agenda of US business reformers. Regarding the influence of the USA in the process of reconfiguration of Brazilian educational policies, the study by Tarlau and Moeller (2020) reports how a group of high-ranking Brazilian government officials, sponsored by the Lemann foundation, attended seminars at Yale University, in the US, to obtain information from public officials who participated in the implementation of US curriculum standards.

It was also possible to identify elements of managerialism in the guidelines of policies related to the teaching profession in Brazil. D-10 highlights the presence of these elements:

THE CREATION OF PROFESSIONAL BENCHMARKS

To guide professional policies, as is intended in the Brazilian case, it is necessary that benchmarks to be created encompass not only the concept of a symbol, but also **the concept of quality standard**.

For this, three steps are necessary (Kleinhenze Ingvarson, 2007):

- 1. Define what is a good exercise of the teaching profession.**
- 2. Decide how to measure this good exercise of the teaching profession – and look for evidence that will indicate whether it is taking place.**
3. Identify levels that allow decision-making (D-10, *s. d.*, P. 14, emphasis added).

Hood (1991) states that the establishment of performance standards and measures explains one of the elements present in the administrations of countries that implemented

the New Public Management (managerialism), thus characterizing this model of public administration.

Document D-11 highlights the use of professional teaching references, by several countries, to guide teachers' education process:

The use of professional teaching references to guide training processes is very present in educational systems such as those in Ontario, Canada, and California, in the United States. There, the benchmarks are used as the basis for formative assessment systems in which teachers and mentors or other professionals come together to formulate, put into practice, and monitor professional development plans as part of support programs for beginning teachers and continuing education programs, as well as opportunities for collective discussion about what is expected from teaching and use for self-assessment and reflection on practice (ONTARIO COLLEGE OF TEACHERS, 2016 *Apud* D-11, *s. d.*, p. 11; STATE OF CALIFORNIA, 2009; 2012;).

The D-11 document: *Example of Breaking Down a California Benchmark into Levels of Development*, extracted from *Continuum of Teaching Practice* (2012) — translated version — and the document D-12, entitled: *California Standards for the Teaching Profession (CSTP - 2009)* — translated version — deal with Californian references for teacher education.

The D-02 document is a report prepared by the Carlos Chagas Foundation, which aims to provide evidence-based subsidies for continuing teacher education in Brazil. It is important to highlight that other analyzed documents consider that the guidelines contained in D-02 are based on evidence, therefore, likely to be considered in directing public policies for the continuing teacher education in Brazil. This document contains the following question: "What are the characteristics of effective initiatives in continuing education?" To answer this question, the document considers that:

The answer to the first question is based on texts that present reviews of empirical studies that evaluated the effectiveness of continuing teacher education programs implemented in Australia, Canada, the United Kingdom, Holland, New Zealand, Israel and **mostly in the United States** (SNOW-RENNER; LAUER, 2005; YOON *et al.*, 2007; TIMPERLEY *et al.*, 2007; BLANK; DE LAS ALAS, 2009 *Apud* D-02, 2017, p. 6, emphasis added).

In the D-02 report, the studies considered as likely to subsidize the debate about teacher education in Brazil are mostly from the US. The report claims that the Brazilian literature on continuing teacher education does not give subsidies for the effectiveness of those training courses, since national studies do not focus on "[...] assessing the effectiveness of continuing education experiences" (D-02, 2017, p. 14).

The studies that the D-02 report considers significant to direct the actions of continuing teacher education in Brazil understand that the efficiency of training is

diagnosed by observing the improvement of the academic performance of the students in standardized tests. They also propose evaluating aspects such as students' attitudes and values, through other instruments. It is important to consider that the tests reflect the student's socioeconomic level. Thus, the success or failure of a student in a test would not be conditioned only by factors internal to the school (FREITAS, 2016).

Resuming the analysis of the D-02, it considers that the improvement of the teacher's performance could be evaluated from reports and through their observation by third parties. Thus, it is possible to state that the D-02 document is permeated by a pragmatic character, considering tests of teachers' knowledge or observation as conception of evidence. In this context, the report highlights the *Act No Child Left Behind* (NCLB) in the US as an important milestone for continuing teacher education.

Thus, the US federal legislation No Child Left Behind of 2001 established, among other definitions, that the continuing education financed by its funds should have the following characteristics, as summarized by Yoon *et al.* (2007):

- be sustainable, intensive, and content-focused, to have a positive and lasting impact on the teacher's work in the classroom;
- be aligned and directly related to state curriculum documents and assessments;
- improve and increase teachers' knowledge of the subjects they teach;
- improve teachers' understanding of pedagogical strategies considered effective based on scientific research;
- be evaluated regularly in terms of its effects on teacher effectiveness and student performance.

From the requirements of the No Child Left Behind Act, the number of studies grew exponentially, **seeking to evaluate the effects of continuing education initiatives carried out in the North American context with the quality profile demanded in the Act. This explains the predominance of studies based on initiatives carried out in the United States, as well as the predominance of literature reviews carried out by North-American researchers** (D-02, 2017, p. 15, emphasis added).

It is pertinent to carry out a reflection on the effectiveness of *accountability* and tests associated with the NCLB, bearing in mind that document D-02, which presents a survey of the literature based on evidence to contribute to the debate about the continuing teacher education in Brazil, considers the importance of the NCLB as a milestone with regard to the assessment of continuing teacher education in the US.

Freitas (2018) considers that the NCLB involved a process of *accountability* that little gains brought to US education. The author discusses a set of studies that show several negative consequences arising from curriculum standardization policies such as *Common Core* (equivalent to the BNCC) and the NCLB policy.

To Freitas (2018), such policies of accountability produced: professors' excessive

time spent guiding students to take tests; grade increases and inflation, as well as fraud leading to arrests; increased stress among parents, teachers, and students; illusion that the learning gap between rich and poor narrowed; excessive emphasis on English Language and Mathematics and little attention to other areas — as occurs in Brazil with BNCC and New High School. Some states, afraid of sanctions associated with standardized tests, defined the level of proficiency of students in their own way, lowering the level of tests, instead of increasing them, as occurred in South Carolina and New York (FREITAS, 2018).

The NCLB law, passed in the USA, can be considered an example of a policy of accountability, which is based on the results of standardized tests of high impact to define sanctions and other interventions in school districts, and educational establishments, for teachers and students (AFONSO, 2012). The standardized, high-impact tests were criticized by different social stakeholders, such as politicians, education specialists and prestigious scientific associations, such as the *FairTest* organization, which raised questions about the centrality attributed to test results for decision-making (AFONSO, 2012).

Ravitch (2011) considered that NCLB was devoid of educational ideas, being a technocratic approach to school reform that measured “success” only in relation to standardized test scores, so that the priority was to “train” students for the tests, leaving learning in the background. According to the author, NCLB contributed to the closure and privatization of several schools that failed to reach the imposed rates. The author is categorical in stating that “[...] there is no set of substantial evidence demonstrating that low-performing schools can be reversed by any of the solutions prescribed by law” (RAVITCH, 2011, p. 125).

To Freitas (2018), the National Common Core Curriculum Base, tests, and accountability, which are associated with the ongoing educational reform in Brazil, are devices that induce educational institutions to resort to private solutions to solve the problems associated with the implementation of those policies. Standardization is a key element in assessment and accountability processes. It is noteworthy that those elements are part of the managerial doctrine of public administration.

Given the above, we question how much it is worth considering the legitimacy of the evidence contained in the D-02 analyzed here, in view of the number of studies that raise, at least, the controversy in relation to the “efficacy” and legitimacy of the positive effects of continuing teacher training in the US, considering actions from the NCLB.

Governance as a principle

This category discusses aspects related to document D-06, titled: *Implementation Guide for the National Common Core Curriculum Base: Guidelines for the BNCC implementation process (2018)*, whose structure brings very often the term “governance”. D-06 considers a “BNCC implementation path”, which involves seven

transversal actions, the first being the “Implementation governance structure”². It should be noted that this guide refers to the Elementary School and Early Childhood Education Stage of Basic Education, as the part of the BNCC referring to High School was still being prepared. However, the study of this document can provide a broad view of the processes linked to the implementation of the BNCC also in the High School stage, as the document indicates that, later, this stage will be considered.

The term governance, of the 13 documents analyzed, is present only in D-06; however, it is cited several times. Bearing in mind that this document refers to the BNCC implementation process, it is pertinent to reflect on the term. It is important to highlight that the meaning of governance is polysemous. Among the areas of knowledge in which the discussion on governance stands out, we consider International Relations, Development Theories and Private Administration (SECCHI, 2009).

Bevir (2011) understands that governance has two perspectives regarding the analysis of the public sector. The first is related to the economic concept of rationality, approaching the ideals of neoliberalism, New Public Management and outsourcing. The second would be associated with the sociological concept of rationality, approaching the idea of the Third Way, which understands that the State must reduce its direct role in the economy, allowing more space for the private initiative, without mitigating its devices of control and socioeconomic direction and combat social inequalities. For Bevir (2011), the idea of governance would be related to the State’s performance through networks and partnerships, and different government sectors must work together in a coordinated way, delimiting cross-cutting goals and objectives.

According to Rhodes (2010), the term governance represents the arrangement of organizations, whether private, State or civil society, that are involved in the delivery of public services. Secchi’s (2009) study considers that public governance can also characterize a movement fostered by managerialism, being the successor of the Weberian bureaucratic model.

Document D-06 suggests a “[...] governance structure that favors articulation between actions at the national, state, and municipal levels and organizes forms of collaboration in the process” (p. 10). From this fragment, we interpret that governance would be related to the articulation between the federal, state, and municipal governments and with the organization of collaboration in the processes related to the implementation of the BNCC. This understanding would be in line with the document from the Latin American Center for Development Administration (CLAD), which understands governance as “[...] the capacity of the State to efficiently transform politically taken decisions into reality” (CLAD, 1998, p. 08).

² The other actions would be: 2- Study of Curriculum References; 3- (Re)elaboration of the Curriculum; 4- Continuing Education for the New Curricula; 5- Review of Pedagogical Projects - PP; 6- Didactic Resources; 7- Assessment and Learning Monitoring) (D-06, 2018a, p. 3).

Returning to the analysis of D-06, the following fragment describes the main objective in having a governance structure for the implementation of the BNCC.

IMPLEMENTATION GOVERNANCE STRUCTURING

THE MAIN OBJECTIVE OF THIS DIMENSION IS TO PREPARE THE STATE AND MUNICIPAL NETWORKS FOR CURRICULUM (RE)DEVELOPMENT* IN COLLABORATION, RESULTING IN A CURRICULUM DOCUMENT THAT COVERS THE WHOLE STATE**. THERE IS ALSO THE POSSIBILITY OF MUNICIPALITIES CHOOSING TO WORK IN PARTNERSHIP WITH OTHER MUNICIPALITIES OR EVEN ALONE.

The first step is to build a structure in which everyone feels represented, municipal and state networks, and knows what their contribution to the process will be. At this stage, definitions of the collaboration and governance regime take place (D-06, 2018, p. 4).³

Milani and Solinís (2002) rescue the historical genesis of the debate on “governance”. The authors resume the study published in 1937 by Ronald Coase, entitled *The Nature of the Firm*. In this study, governance deals with “[...] devices operationalized by the firm to conduct effective coordination that concern two registers: internal protocols, when the firm develops its networks and questions internal hierarchies; contracts and the application of norms, when it is open to outsourcing” (MILANI; SOLINÍS, 2002, p. 270). In this direction, Milani and Solinís (2002) consider that, through governance, there would be a replacement of hierarchical firms, vertically integrated by global organizations and organized in networks. With these considerations, we intend to show that the concept of governance had its origin in the business world, and this governance would be related to global organizations arranged in networks, and not to vertically hierarchical structures.

Analyzing another fragment of D-06, which deals with the first cross-sectional action referring to the “structuring of implementation governance”, located in the topic “1.3: Planning the BNCC implementation process”, the text fragment that follows considers the importance of governance of regional instances, represented by the National Union of Municipal Education Managers (UNDIME), articulated with state instances, represented by CONSED:

How can the governance of regional instances be organized in its articulation with the state instance (Consed and Undime)?

SUGGESTION: Each state has its own communication and governance routine between regional and state levels. In many cases, the definition of representatives from different regions that can organize the discussion locally, systematize, and take their positions and contributions to the state and other regions facilitates

³ Asterisks refer to footnotes that may be consulted in the document cited.

the work flow. In addition, it is important to establish a routine of exchanges and sharing agreed with the state instance (Consed and Undime), ensuring the pace and constant participation of regional instances in the process (D-06, 2018, p. 15-16).

Also in D-06, in the fourth transversal action: “Continuing Education for the New Curricula”, the importance of defining governance for such a process is highlighted.

4.1 DEFINE GOVERNANCE

The State Curriculum Coordination, with the support of the State Curriculum Commission, should define the governance for continuing education in collaboration. It is suggested that each state has a central team, made up of State Curriculum Coordinators and leaders of continuing education actions in the state and municipal networks, as well as regional teams distributed throughout the state. This central team must guarantee the education of the teachers and management teams of state and municipal schools in the state for the new curriculum (D-06, 2018, p. 40).

Milani and Solinís (2002) discuss, among other aspects, how much the idea of governance is inserted in a context that includes the attenuation of the State’s participation in the provision of social services as something necessary for governance. These authors also realize that the conception of governance would be related to the understanding that the State must be reconfigured when it proves to be deficient in executing some of its functions. Thus, the State would no longer hold the monopoly of promoting the public good. This would result in a public space made up of complex networks of interests and interactions between different actors. Still, Milani and Solinís (2002) consider that governance would be associated with macroeconomic reforms to open markets, guided by neoliberal economists.

The strong mention of third sector institutions in the WG Continuing Education documents contained on the site of CONSED, the support and partnership that these institutions provide to this council, to the BNCC implementation processes, and to the strong presence of managerial elements in the analyzed documents suggests that the understanding of governance contained in D-06 is inserted in the managerial proposal of public administration.

Regarding the relationship between third sector institutions and CONSED, the following fragment highlights their participation in the implementation of the BNCC and the NEM:

States, municipalities, and the Union build a common agenda

The Ministry of Education and entities of the **third sector** are partners with states and municipalities in the execution of the Learning Agenda, an agenda with priority and urgent actions to develop Education in the country.

In addition to MEC, only on the Curriculum Front and the New High School, Consed has the support of Instituto Unibanco, Itaú BBA, Oi Futuro, Instituto Natura, Movimento pela Base, Inspirare, Instituto Sonho Grande, Fundação Telefônica and Instituto Reúna (CONSED, 2019, emphasis added).

It is important to emphasize that the managerialist notion includes the need to mitigate the State's participation in the management, administration, execution, and even formulation and implementation of public policies.

After those mentioned above, the sense of governance that seems to be more aligned with the processes of implementation of the BNCC is that considered by Motta (2012), who understands that governance in the neoliberal context is a strategy to legitimize the neoliberal ideals and that aims to empty the political and ideological character of the debate. The idea of administrative efficiency displaces the ideology of well-being and social rights to the ideas of efficiency and quality of public services, legitimizing the idea of democracy as an instrument for controlling public policies.

The decrease in State participation, with regard to social policies, is the decrease, ultimately, in the representation of popular interests in these policies. In this context, the notion of democracy is linked to the participation of sectors of civil society, such as third sector institutions, in the management, administration and execution of these social policies.

Assessments, control, and monitoring

Control is a fundamental concept of all management systems. (BRAVERMAN, 1977). For Tragtenberg (1985), a broad analysis of managerial systems should consider the process of shifting scientific management from the sphere of factory administration to public administration, with control being an element present in all managerial systems.

In part of the documents, the need to control and evaluate actions and results linked to the continuing teacher education for the implementation of the BNCC stands out.

Collaboration Regime

- The need to institutionalize the collaboration regime for continuing education policies, via the development and implementation of a Technical Cooperation Term between States and Municipalities. This term can define, for collaboration in continuing education policies, responsibilities, operational model, financing, and joint systematic of **monitoring and assessment** (D-01, 2017, p. 12, emphasis added).

Axis 9 I Monitoring and Assessment

If continuing teacher education policies are expected to obtain the results established in their formulation, they should be constantly monitored and

assessed. For this, we should consider:

- The construction of a plan of **monitoring and assessment** of the policy as a structuring pillar of continuing education programs, and not as an action to be considered only after implementing these programs.
- The importance of recognizing the **monitoring and assessing mechanisms as a tool for analysing the results during the policy implementation process, thus enabling continuous adjustments to this policy** (D-05, 2018, p. 14, emphasis added).

The assessment starts with the actions carried out within the scope of a given policy or program to analyze the impact of these actions. The assessment is linked to **outcome indicators, which, in the context of continuing education, are linked to observations of changes in the teachers' teaching process and the impact on student performance. For teachers, the results can be ascertained through observation of the classroom and for students, through large-scale assessments and periodic school assessments.** (D-05, 2018, p. 13, emphasis added).

The last fragment of text quoted in document D-05 considers that the students' performance expressed in indicators and results, such as large-scale assessments or periodic school assessments, makes it possible to analyze the quality of the continuing teacher education. In addition, such indicators and outcomes should have an impact on the change in teaching activities in the classroom, making it possible for these teachers to have their practice monitored.

This situation tends to disregard out-of-school variables, placing too much emphasis on intra-school variables, which contributes to increasing teachers' accountability for students' "unsatisfactory performance", which, according to the recommendations of multilateral organizations, should contribute to the reconfiguration in forms of management (SHIROMA; EVANGELISTA, 2011). According to Ormond e Löffler (1999), this results-based management logic represents an important element of managerialism ideology.

In Brazil, from the 1990s, the position of the State more as an evaluator than a provider of education was accelerated. In this scenario, external assessment gained importance, becoming a control mechanism for schools.

From the creation of the National Education Guidelines and Framework Law (LDB) of 1996, the control of the education results was reinforced by the external assessment. However, during the development and creation of the assessment systems, professionals were practically disregarded in the debate on education. This strengthened a perspective of managing education that considers almost exclusively the cost-benefit ratio and the need to disseminate results (dropout, repetition, and exclusion rates) (SANTANA, 2018). This way of understanding education has contributed to the increase in competitiveness

between educational institutions and to the development of ways of *accountability*, thus constituting the evaluating State.

For Santana (2018), with regard to education, the notion of an evaluating State was strengthened in the world in the 1970s. There was a decrease in investment in social areas, a decrease in qualitative assessments, and the strengthening of speeches based on technical rationality. Still according to Santana (2018), another factor that contributed to the strengthening of the notion of the Evaluating State was the US report *A Nation at Risk* (1980). This document emphasized the low student performance in international tests. Thus, based on this report, two measures were taken: accountability and competition between schools. In this context, market logic enters education. According to Dale (1994), the above favored the development of a “Structured Global Agenda for Education” in the world.

Next, a text fragment from D-07, which performs some “Considerations on the effective use of the 1/3 hour activity for continuing education” (D-07, 2018, p. 18).

1) 1/3 GUARANTEE LEGISLATION FOR EXTRA-CLASS ACTIVITIES

I. Regulation of 1/3 of an hour/activity for extracurricular activities in municipal and state schools considering and strengthening the collaboration regime;

II. Forecast of financial resources from different sources - federal, state, municipal, and district - to guarantee the 1/3 hour/activity destined for extracurricular activities and for the execution of continuing education.

2) CONDITIONS FOR IMPLEMENTING THE 1/3 FOR CONTINUOUS TEACHER EDUCATION

III. Assurance of distribution of part of the teaching workday for continuing education combined with guidance on the use and monitoring of that time;

IV. Regulation of the collaboration regime for compliance with the 1/3 aimed at teacher education between states, municipalities (sic), and the federal district.

3) CONDITIONS FOR FORMATIVE MEETINGS TO BE PEDAGOGICALLY EFFECTIVE

V. Presence of a qualified teachers' educator at the school and guarantee of support structure for this educator in the education network;

VI. Guarantee, in continuing education, the development of investigative practice with a focus on improving didactic-pedagogical actions and their results (D-07, 2018, p. 18).

The previous fragment highlights the importance of the hour/activity for the process of continuing teacher education. Again, emphasis is placed on training processes to improve the quality of student learning:

4) MONITORING AND ASSESSMENT OF THE FORMATIVE PROCESS OF THE NETWORK

VII. Implementation of a monitoring structure at the different management levels that allows checking, with clearly defined indicators and evidence, whether continuing education has achieved the expected results with efficacy, efficiency, and effectiveness;

VIII. Define indicators to assess the continuing teacher education, considering the comprehensive student education in social, emotional, and cognitive aspects (D-07, 2018, p. 18).

According to Afonso (2004), underlying every assessment is the confrontation between the real situation, the one experienced and the target of the assessment, and the virtual one, the one deduced from reference standards. The author believes that these situations are usually discrepant. In this sense, such actions related to the monitoring and assessment of the network's formative processes, if they do not properly consider extracurricular variables as influencing students' learning level, can constitute instruments of teacher accountability, for the legitimization of the entry of subjects from the world business in education, justifying the reconfiguration of educational policies in the sense of increasing their mercantile character (FREITAS, 2018).

Still in D-07, the following stand out:

Monitoring can be understood as a means of verifying whether the actions that were planned are being carried out and, if they are being carried out, whether they are being carried out in the best possible way. **Monitoring** is related to **process indicators** that may include considerations on the provision of pedagogical resources by the Secretariat, the workload for collective activities, formative methodologies, and teacher attendance, for example. **It is necessary to define tools and responsible for monitoring each indicator and the frequency of data collection** (D-07, 2018, p. 34, emphasis added).

Underlying the monitoring logic is the assessment logic. According to Santana (2018), the assessment systems developed in recent decades have been guided by commercial logic, contributing to the increase in the control devices of what is taught in public schools, valuing the accountability mechanisms, and disclaiming the State for the quality of education offered.

In this sense, the assessment would exist to identify whether the market requirements are being met; and large-scale assessments end up representing a tool for State control over what is taught in public institutions.

Final Considerations

This analysis suggests that the proposal for continuing teacher education, in accordance with CONSED guidelines, is strongly influenced by US policies, which guide policies and actions related to continuing education processes in Brazil.

Importance is given to curriculum standardization, as a managerial principle inserted in the administration of teacher education processes for their greater control.

Curriculum standardization, tests, standardization of procedures related to teacher education processes and the assessment of those processes indicate how much the influence of US policies in Brazil is contributing to the deepening of managerial principles in teacher education and education as a whole. Such principles that gained strength in Brazil in the 1990s, with the PDRAE, are increasingly present in the current educational political context.

The notion of governance present in one of the analyzed documents also characterizes the guidelines of CONSED for continuing teacher education. When questioning the notion of governance, we identified that it is aligned with managerialism. In this way, it is reinforced that the managerial principles and the ideas that surround them, explicitly or tacitly, permeate the documents analyzed with implications for the continuing teacher education processes to be conducted in implementing the BNCC.

We consider that several elements that constitute managerialism are also strongly present in discussions about assessment. In the analyzed documents, the emphasis on the monitoring and assessment of continuing teacher education translates this aspect and contributes to making teachers accountable. In this context, the need to establish a culture of performativity, typical of managerialism, tends to influence the subjectivity of the individual, which, in turn, contributes to these teachers taking responsibility, and being held increasingly accountable for the success or failure of the actions developed (BALL, 2006). Linked to these understandings, Gaulejac (2007) recognizes, among other aspects, that managerial principles, through the rationality of means, would contribute to the devaluation of social and human purposes, even though these purposes are constitutive of these institutions.

In view of the above, the guidelines of CONSED are characterized, related to continuing teacher education, as marked by managerialism that has been permeating the implementation of educational policies worldwide. This favors the possibility of seeing possible results of processes of continuing teacher education conducted on the bases of managerialism. According to what was discussed here, the influence of managerialism in the formative processes has contributed to disastrous results that ignore the contributions of the educational literature about teacher education. The work socialized here constitutes broader research that can favor the understanding of how managerialism can be, in fact, inserted in processes of continuing teacher education that aim at the implementation of the BNCC and the New High School and bring contributions about how managerialism, in this context, can be faced.

REFERENCES

- ABRUCIO, Fernando Luiz. O impacto do modelo gerencial na administração pública: um breve estudo sobre a experiência internacional recente. *Cadernos ENAP*, n. 10, Brasília: Enap: 1997. Disponível em: <http://repositorio.enap.gov.br/handle/1/556>. Acesso em: 16 jul. 2022.
- AFONSO, Almerindo Janela. Para uma concetualização alternativa de *accountability* em educação. *Educação & Sociedade*, Campinas, v. 33, n. 119, p. 471-484, 2012. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.1590/S0101-73302012000200008>. Acesso em 10 jul. 2022.
- AFONSO, Natércio. Avaliação e Desenvolvimento organizacional da Escola. *Revista Meta: Avaliação*, Rio de Janeiro, v. 1, n. 2, p. 150-169, 2004.
- BALL, Stephen. Sociologia das Políticas Educacionais e pesquisa crítico-social: uma revisão pessoal das políticas educacionais e da pesquisa política educacional. *Currículo sem fronteiras*, v. 6, n. 2, p. 10-32, 2006. Disponível em: <http://www.curriculosemfronteiras.org/vol6iss2articles/ball.pdf>. Acesso em 12 jul. 2022
- BEVIR, Mark. Governança democrática: uma genealogia. *Revista de Sociologia e Política*, Curitiba, v.19, n. 39, p. 1033-114, jun. 2011. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.1590/S0104-44782011000200008>. Acesso em 13 jul. 2022.
- BRASIL. Presidência da República. *Plano Diretor da Reforma do Aparelho do Estado*. Brasília: Ministério da Administração Federal e Reforma do Estado - MARE, 1995.
- BRASIL. Lei nº 9.394/96, de 20 de dezembro de 1996. Estabelece as Diretrizes e Bases da Educação Nacional. *Diário Oficial da União*: seção 1, Brasília, DF, 1996. Disponível em: http://www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/leis/19394.htm. Acesso em: 23 jul. 2022.
- BRAVERMAN, Harry. *Trabalho e Capital Monopolista: A degradação do Trabalho no Século XX*. Tradução de Nathanael C. Caixeiro. Rio de Janeiro: Zahar Editores, 1977.
- BRESSER-PEREIRA, Luiz Carlos. Gestão do setor público: estratégia e estrutura para um novo Estado. In: PEREIRA, Luiz Carlos Bresser; SPINK, Peter (orgs.). *Reforma do Estado e administração pública gerencial*. 7. ed. Rio de Janeiro: Editora FGV, 2006.
- CARNEIRO, Adele de Toledo. *Os preceitos gerenciais para o desenvolvimento: A influência do Banco Mundial para a consolidação do gerencialismo no Brasil na década de 1990*. 2019. 307f. Tese (em Administração de Empresas), Escola de Administração de Empresas de São Paulo, Fundação Getúlio Vargas, São Paulo, 2019.
- CLAD. *Uma nova gestão pública para América Latina*. Documento do CLAD, 1998. (Conselho Científico do Centro Latino Americano de Administração para o desenvolvimento).
- CONSED (Conselho Nacional de Secretários de Educação) (2017). *Grupo de Trabalho Formação Continuada de Professores*. Documento de considerações para orientar o aperfeiçoamento das políticas de Formação Continuada de Professores à luz da implementação da Base Nacional Comum Curricular (BNCC). Disponível em: <https://www.consed.org.br/storage/download/5adf3c0d134be.pdf>. Acesso em: 22 nov. 2022.
- CONSED (Conselho Nacional de Secretários de Educação) (2019). *MEC e terceiro setor*

apoiam estados na construção dos currículos do Novo Ensino Médio. Disponível em: <https://www.consed.org.br/noticia/mec-e-terceiro-setor-apoiam-estados-na-construcao-dos-curriculos-do-novo-ensino-medio>. Acesso em: 03 ago. 2022.

CONSED (Conselho Nacional de Secretários de Educação) (s.d.). *Formação Continuada de Professores*. Relatório Inspiracional. Disponível em: <https://www.consed.org.br/storage/download/relatorioteilus.pdf>. Acesso em: 10 abr. 2022.

COSTA, Frederico Lustosa da. *Reforma do Estado e Contexto Brasileiro*: crítica do paradigma gerencialista. Rio de Janeiro: Editora FGV, 2010.

DALE, Roger. A promoção do mercado educacional e a polarização da educação. *Educação, Sociedade & Culturas*, Porto, n. 2, p. 109-139, 1994.

DECONTO, Diomar Caríssimo Selli, OSTERMANN, Fernanda. Treinar professores para aplicar a BNCC: as novas diretrizes e seu projeto mercadológico para a formação docente. *Caderno Brasileiro de Ensino de Física*, v. 38, n. 3, p. 1.730-1.761, dez. 2021. Disponível em: <https://www.fpce.up.pt/ciie/?q=publication/revista-educa%C3%A7%C3%A3o-sociedade-culturas/edition/educa%C3%A7%C3%A3o-sociedade-culturas-2>. Acesso em 14 jul. 2022.

FREITAS, Luiz Carlos. *A reforma empresarial da educação*: nova direita, velhas idéias. 1. ed. São Paulo: Expressão Popular, 2018.

FREITAS, Luiz Carlos. Três teses sobre as reformas empresariais da educação: perdendo a ingenuidade. *Centro de Estudos Educação e Sociedade*, Campinas, v. 36, n. 99, p. 137-153, 2016. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.1590/CC0101-32622016160502>. Acesso em 19 jul. 2022.

GAULEJAC, Vincent de. *Gestão como doença social*: Ideologia, poder gerencialista e fragmentação social. Tradução de Ivo Storniolo. 6. ed. Aparecida, SP: Idéias & Letras, 2007.

GOMES, Albiane Oliveira; LIMA, Francisco Willams Campos. A introdução da lógica mercantil nas políticas públicas educacionais. In: BRITO, Ana Paula; VALE, Cassio; SOUZA, Leila (orgs.). *Políticas públicas educacionais e a mercantilização da educação no Brasil*. Curitiba, PR: CRV, 2019. p.15-23.

HOOD, Christopher. A Public Management for all seasons? *Public Administration*, v. 69, p. 31-19, 1991. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9299.1991.tb00779.x>. Acesso em: 21 jul. 2022.

LIMA, Antonio Bosco. Políticas educacionais e o processo de “democratização” da gestão educacional. In: LIMA, Antonio Bosco; VIRIATO, Edaguimar Orquizas; SOUZA, Silvana Aparecida; ZANARDINI, Isaura Mônica Souza; HIDALGO, Angela Maria; PINZAN, Leni Terezinha Marcelo (orgs.). *Estado, políticas educacionais e gestão compartilhada*. 1. ed. São Paulo: Xamã, 2004. p. 17-38.

MILANI, Carlos; SOLINÍS, Gérman. Pensar a democracia na governança mundial: algumas pistas para o futuro. In: MILANI, C.; ARTURI, C.; SOLINÍS, G (Orgs.). *Democracia e Governança Mundial*: que regulações para o século XXI? Porto Alegre: UFRGS, 2002.

MORAES, Roque. Uma tempestade de luz: a compreensão possibilitada pela análise textual

discursiva. *Ciência & Educação*, Bauru, v.9, n.2, p.191211, 2003. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.1590/S1516-73132003000200004>. Acesso em: 23 jul. 2022.

MOTTA, Vânia Cardoso. *Ideologia do capital social*: atribuindo uma face mais humana ao capital. Rio de Janeiro: EdUERJ, 2012.

NASCIMENTO, Fabrício do; FERNANDES, Hylío Laganá; MENDONÇA, Viviane Melo de. *Revista HISTEDBR On-line*, Campinas, n.39, p. 225-249, 2010.

ORMOND, Derry; LOFFLER, Elke. A nova gerência pública. *Revista do Serviço Público*, Brasília, n. 2, p. 67-89, 1999.

OSTERMANN, Fernanda; REZENDE, Flavia. BNCC, Reforma do Ensino Médio e BNC-Formação: um pacote privatista, utilitarista minimalista que precisa ser revogado. *Caderno Brasileiro de Ensino de Física*, v. 38, n. 3, p. 1381-1387, dez. 2021. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.5007/2175-7941.2021.e85172%20>. Acesso em: 23 jul. 2022.

RAVITCH, Diane. *Vida e morte do grande sistema escolar americano*: como os Testes Padronizados e o modelo de Mercado Ameaçam a Educação. Tradução de Marcelo Duarte. Porto Alegre: Sulina, 2011.

RHODES, Roderick Arthur William. *Understanding Governance: Policy Networks, Governance, Reflexivity and Accountability*. 7 ed. Maidenhead: Open University Press, 2010.

RODRIGUES, Larissa Zancan; PEREIRA, Beatriz; MOHR, Adriana. Recentes Imposições à Formação de Professores e seus Falsos Pretextos: as BNC Formação Inicial e Continuada para Controle e Padronização da Docência. *Revista Brasileira de Pesquisa em Educação em Ciências*, v. 21, 2021. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.28976/1984-2686rbpec2021u12771315>. Acesso em: 18 jul. 2022.

SANTANA, Andréia da Cunha Malheiros. A constituição do Estado Avaliativo e o aumento das avaliações externas: propagando um ensino desigual para todos. In: ROTHEN, José Carlos; SANTANA, Andréia da Cunha Malheiros (orgs.). *Avaliação da educação*: referências para uma primeira conversa. São Carlos: EdUFSCar, 2018. p.37-50. E-book.

SANTOS, Geniana, BORGES, Veronica, LOPES, Alice Casimiro. Formação de Professores e Reformas Curriculares: Entre Projeções e Normatividade. *Linhas Críticas*, Brasília, DF, v.25, p.239-256, 2019. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.26512/lc.v25.2019.26200>. Acesso em: 22 jul. 2022.

SECCHI, Leornado. Modelos organizacionais e reformas da administração pública. *Revista de Administração Pública*, Rio de Janeiro, v. 43, n. 2, p. 347-69, 2009. Disponível em: <https://doi.org/10.1590/S0034-76122009000200004>. Acesso em: 15 jul. 2022.

SHIROMA, Eneida Oto; EVANGELISTA, Olinda. Avaliação e responsabilização pelos resultados: atualizações nas formas de gestão de professores. *Perspectiva*, Florianópolis, v. 29, n. 1, p. 127-160, 2011. Disponível em: http://educa.fcc.org.br/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S0102-54732011000100007&lng=pt&nrm=iso. Acesso em: 19 jul. 2022.

TARLAU, Rebecca; MOELLER, Kathryn. O consenso por filantropia: Como uma fundação privada estabeleceu a BNCC no Brasil. *Currículo sem Fronteiras*, v. 20, n. 2, p. 553-603,

2020. Disponível em: <http://dx.doi.org/10.35786/1645-1384.v20.n2.11>. Acesso 21 jul. 2022.

TRAGTENBERG, Maurício. *Burocracia e ideologia*. São Paulo: Ática, 1985.

VILLANI, Alberto; PACCA, Jesuina Lopes de Almeida; FREITAS, Denise de. Formação do Professor de Ciências no Brasil: Tarefa Impossível? In: ENCONTRO DE PESQUISA EM ENSINO DE FÍSICA, 8., Águas de Lindóia, 2002. *Anais [...]*. Águas de Lindóia: Sociedade Brasileira de Física, 2002.

Text received on 08/06/2022

Text approved on 11/29/2022